

Lead of the UNODC @u'!eg"ona# Off"&e "n A'u D%a'" (as a o"nted\$ and t%at t%e!eafte! %e (ou#d 'e t!ansfe!!ed to a P03 ost "n V"enna.

7. B* ema"# dated - De&em'e! 2009\$ t%e C%"ef of t%e 1uman)esou!&es / anagement @e!+"&e &onf"!med to t%e A #"&ant t%e de&"s"ons t%at %ad 'een &ommu"&ated to %"m du!"ng t%e meet"ng on 1 De&em'e!. On 21 De&em'e! 2009\$ t%e A #"&ant !e7uested a management e+a#uat"on of t%e de&"s"on to no #onge! #ate!a##* !eass"gn %"m to A'u D%a'"\$ and on 23 De&em'e!\$ %e f"#ed an A #"&at"on !e7uest"ng t%"s T!"'una# to sus end "m #ementat"on of t%at de&"s"on. T%e a #"&at"on (as !eg"ste!ed unde! t%e num'e! UNDT/GVA/2009/109 and (as fo##o(ed on - / a* 2010 '* an a #"&at"on on t%e me!"ts. T%e !e7uest fo! sus ens"on of a&t"on (as !e,e&t&ed '* O!de! No. 1 ?GVA/2010A of < Janua!* 2010.

Parties' submissions

17. The Applicant's contentions are

a. The UNDT and the Applicant's case should not be based on the memo of - De&em'e! 2009 (ou#d not 'e &"ted fa&tua##* and a&&e ted "n "ts ent"!et* "n &onne&t"on ("t% %'s a #"&at"on fo! !e+"s"on of 21 De&em'e! 2009\$ to (%&%%e !e&e"+ed a !e #* f!om t%e /anagement 4+a#uat"on Un"t on 3 Fe' !ua!* 2010H "n t%at !e #*\$ no ment"on "s "ndeed made of t%e memo of - De&em'e! 2009. St "s t%e d"s&o+e!* of t%"s fa&t t%at &onst"tutes t%e 'as"s fo! %'s !e7uest fo! !e+"s"onH

' . Ie d"s&o+e!ed t%"s fa&t afte! a !e+"e (of t%e do&umentat"on of %'s &ase "n 3 / a!&%;\$ (%en "t st!u&2 %"m t%at t%e statements '* t%e)es ondent "n %'s !e #* of 2- Fe' !ua!* 2012 &ont!ad&ted t%e)es ondent's !e+"ous statementsH

&. Indeed\$ "n &ase UNDT/2011/10.\$ t%e)es ondent de&#a!ed unde! oat% t%at t%e Applicant's case should be based on the management e+a#uat"on of t%e de&"s"on to 3demote: %"m. No (\$ "n %'s !e #* of 2- Fe' !ua!* 2012 "n &ase UNDT/2012/0- . \$ t%e su' ,e&t of t%"s a #"&at"on fo! !e+"s"on\$ t%e)es ondent e= !ess#* ment"oned t%e memo of - De&em'e! 2009 !e+"e (ed "n &onne&t"on ("t% anot%e! !e7uest '* t%e Applicant's case fo! management e+a#uat"on\$ to (%&%%e %ad !e&e"+ed a !e #* on 21 @e tem'e! 2011. T%us\$ t%e)es ondent a##eget#* adm"tted t%at t%e memo of - De&em'e! 2009 a#so add!essed t%e Applicant's demot"on. T%at amounted to t%e d"s&o+e!* of a ne (fa&t t%at t%e T!"' una# %ad not 2no (n a 'out (%en "t !ende!ed "ts ,udgmentH

d. The UNDT 0201200- . Al-Mulla ,udgment s%ou#d 'e !e+"sed\$ 'ea!"ng "n m"nd f!om no (on t%at\$ (%en %e su'm"tted %'s !e7uest fo! management e+a#uat"on on 21 De&em'e! 2009\$ t%e Applicant's case should be based on the memo of - De&em'e! 2009\$ "n&#ud"ng t%e de&"s"on to demote %"m f!om P0- to P03.

1;. The)es ondent's &ontent"ons a!eD

a. On 3 Fe'!ua!* 2010\$ t%e A #"&ant !e&e"+ed t%e !e #* of t%e / anagement 4+a#uat"on Un"t to %'s !e7uest fo! management e+a#uat"on of 21 De&em'e! 2009H t%e #atte! (as t%e!efo!e 2no(n to 'ot% t%e A #"&ant and t%e T!"'una# (%en\$ on . A !"# 2012\$ t%e T!"'una# !ende!ed "ts UNDT/2012/0- . ,udgment\$ a !e+"s"on of (%"&% 's !e7uested. T%e A #"&ant &annot t%e!efo!e &a"m t%at %e on#* as&e!ta"ned t%e &ontents of t%e / anagement 4+a#uat"on Un"t's !e #* mo!e t%an t%e!e *ea!s afte! t%at !e #*H

'. 5f t%e A #"&ant (as not sat'sf'ed ("t% t%e / anagement 4+a#uat"on Un"t's !e #*\$ %e &ou#d %a+e !a"sed t%e su',e&t ("t% t%'s T!"'una# \$ &a"m"ng t%at t%e / anagement 4+a#uat"on Un"t %ad not &o!e&t#* !e+"e(ed a## t%e o"nts %e %ad made\$ ' ut %e d"d notH

&. T%e A #"&ant (as t%us a (a!e of t%e ne(fa&t %e %"g%#"g%tsh t%e!efo!e t%e &ond"tions !e7u"led unde! A!t"&e 12 of t%e @tatute of t%e Un"ted Nat"ons D"s ute T!"'una# fo! an a #"&at"on fo! !e+"s"on of ,udgment a!e not metH

d. 4+en su os"ng t%at "t (e!e a ne(fa&t\$ "t d'd not affe&t t%e UNDT/2012/0- . ,udgmentH

e. 5n add"t"on\$ t%e)es ondent ma"nta"ns t%at t%e #ast a!ag!a % of t%e ema"#0memo of - De&em'e! 2009 's not an adm"n"st!at"+e de&"s"on aga"nst (%"&% an a ea# ma* 'e #odged 'ut so#e#* a !em"nde! of t%e te!ms of t%e A #"&ant's &ont!a&t of 21 / a* 2007H "n fa&t\$ t%e A #"&ant %ad 'een a (a!e s"n&e 2007 t%at\$ at t%e end of %'s a o"ntment at t%e P0- #e+e#\$ %e (ou#d !etu!n to t%e P03 #e+e#\$ and %e d'd not &ontest t%ose te!msH

f. T%e A #"&ant "s a&t"ng "n 'ad fa2ur 05 ' (f0 / R 19 12 T9 #5 &#(')-0.488.1679' %

23. The Tribunal cannot fail to point out that the Administrative Tribunal's decision of 19 December 2011, the subject of the judgment of the Tribunal of 12 December 2012, that the respondent failed to send the employee a memo of understanding of management of 21 December 2009. Consequently, the respondent is liable in the circumstances of the case (as a result of the

' . The Applicant's sentence to a* U@I;00 "n &osts to t%e
@e&!eta!*0Gene!a# of t%e Un"ted Nat"ons.

(Signed)

Judge Jean0F!anJo"s Cous"n

Dated t%"s 23^{t%} da* of August 2013

4nte!ed "n t%e)eg"ste! on t%"s 23^{t%} da* of August 2013

(Signed)

)enK / . Va!gas / .\$.)eg"st!a!\$ Gene+a