

5. At the time of the request, the respondent had not produced ex parte the content of

11. 'n 2 August 2013 t e t en A\$ting C #ef of D#ss#on /u!o%t ()CD/*+5 UN13C4P5 \$#\$u"ated t e %e.e.ant J' to a"" t e D#ss#on=s \$#.##"an "o\$a""2,%e\$%u"ted Gene#a" /e%.#Se staff5 #n.#t#ng t ose #nte%ested to a!!"2 no "ate% t an 23 August 2013.

12. T e J' s!e\$#f#ed:

@du\$at#on: Ad.an\$ed deg%ee (Daste% s o% e9u#.a"ent+ #n !u&"#\$ adm#n#st%at#on5 !o"#t#\$a" s\$#en\$e5 #nte%nationa" %e"at#ons o% so\$a" s\$#en\$es. A f#%st un#.e%st2 deg%ee (-a\$ e"o% o% e9u#.a"ent+ 8#t a \$om&#nat#on of e7\$e!t#ona" !%ofess#ona" e7!e#en\$e ma2 &e a\$e!ted #n "#eu of t e ad.an\$ed deg%ee.

@7!e#en\$e: At "east 3 2ea% s fo""o8#ng t e \$om!"et#on of a -a\$ e"o%=s deg%ee o% 2 2ea% s fo""o8#ng \$om!"et#on of a Daste%=s deg%ee5 of !%ogless#.e"2 %es!ons#&"e e7!e#en\$e #n t e f#e"d of !u&"#\$ adm#n#st%at#on5 go.e%nan\$e5 !ea\$e,&u#"d#ng5 and \$ommun#t2 %e"at#ons.

13. T e A!!"#sant5 a Tu%O#s ,C2!%#ot5 a!!"#ed fo% t e Pos#t#on5 and #s a!!"#s\$at#on #n\$"uded a Pe%sona" E#sto%2 P%of#"e ()PEP*+.

14. T e C#.#"an Pe%sonne" 'ff#\$e \$ondu\$ted t e #n#t#a" s\$%een#ng and5 on 30 August 20135 #t !%odu\$ed a "#st of \$and#dates 8 o met t e \$%te#a fo% t e Pos#t#on and anot e% "#st of \$and#dates 8 o d#d not. T e A!!"#sant 8as on t e "#st of \$and#dates not meet#ng t e >o& \$%te#a. 'n t e same da25 t e t en C #ef C#.#"an Pe%sonne" 'ff#\$e% ()CCP' *+ 8%ote to t e E#%#ng Danage% and to D%.C#&o%5 8 o 8as t e "atte%=s su!e%.#so%5 e7!"a#n#ng t at #s off#\$e ad &een .e%2)"#&e#a"* #n t e s\$%een#ng to get as man2 e"#g#&"e \$and#dates as !oss#&"e5 &ut t at a"" t e "o\$a" staff of t e D#ss#on 8 o ad a!!"#ed to t e Pos#t#on 8e%e nonet e"ess s\$%eened out fo% not a.#ng t e %e9u#%ed !%ofess#ona" "e.e" e7!e#en\$e.

15. D%.C#&o% test#f#ed t at #n %es!onse to t e a&o.e5 e to"d t e CCP' t at #n "#g t of t e g%eat #nte%est #n t e t8o !osts among "o\$a" staff5 #t 8ou"d &e a !#t2 not to g#.e an2 of t em a \$ an\$e to \$om!ete. Ee t e%efo%e as0ed t e CCP' to a.e anot e% "oo0 at t e "#st to see #f at "east one G%ee0,C2!%#ot and one Tu%O#s ,C2!%#ot "o\$a" staff mem&e% \$ou"d &e #n\$"uded. Ee den#ed a.#ng a!!"#ed !%essu%e on t e CCP'.

16. -2 ema# dated 2 /e!tem&e% 2013 to D%. C#&o%5 t e CCP ' %e#te%ated #s .#e8 t at no "o\$a" staff mem&e% s 8e#e e"#g#&"e fo% t e Pos#t#on. Ee sa#d t at t e A!!"#\$ant 8as one of t e on"2 t8o "o\$a" \$and#dates 8 o \$ou"d %ea\$ t e #nte%.#e8 stages &ut 8a%ned t at s ou"d t #s &e t e \$ase% #s futu%e assessment must ta0e #nto \$ons#de%at#on F #sG)&o%de%"#ne e"#g#&"#t2*.

1A. D%. C#&o% %es!onded on t e same da2 as0ng t e CCP ' to at "east \$ons#de% t e t8o "o\$a" \$and#dates #dent#f#ed as &e#ng \$"ose% to meet#ng t e %e9u#%ements% to offe% t em a \$ an\$e to \$om!ete as &o%de%"#ne \$ases. 1o""o8#ng t #s message% t e CCP ' added t e A!!"#\$ant and anot e "o\$a" \$and#date to t e "#st of e"#g#&"e ones. ' n 11 /e!tem&e% 2013% a t #%d "o\$a" UN13C4P staff mem&e% 8as #n\$"uded #n t e "#st of e"#g#&"e \$and#dates.

16. D%. C#&o% ad no fut%e d#s\$uss#ons 8#t t e CCP ' a&out t e "#st of e"#g#&"e \$and#dates. Ee to'd t e T%#&una" t at e e7!"a#ned #s mot#.at#on fo% #n\$"ud#ng t ese t8o nat#ona" staff mem&e% s to t e E#%#ng Damage% 8 o %a#sed no o&>e\$t#ons.

1C. T e e#g t s o%t"#sted \$and#dates too0 a 8#tten t&e%st 4 8() - 91#%0791(\$)-3.66%23()9.78%66()9.

Case No.

UNDT/GVA/2014/030

31. In an event the Applicant did not provide evidence of his financial status at the time and Dr. Haddou was based on the information the Applicant submitted in his affidavit at the time the Applicant was appointed as a consultant as not in an effort to be eligible for C.I. Affairs. Dr. Haddou told the Tribunal that the Applicant was 80% as well as noted in his PEP as a Director; he stated that the Applicant's intention to transfer his not on the face of his affidavit to the requirements of the J's 8 is self-evident in the administrative proceedings. In an affidavit and a statement and a communication. / He further stated that the Applicant was not to be considered as a professional in the field of law to be eligible to be appointed in the name of an administrative degree.

32. Dr. Haddou said that some two days later the Applicant informed and asked for the "evidence" of an NP ' position at the "e.e" to be a full-time position. / He stated that the ED Guidelines for the Determination of Level and Step on Recruitment to the Professional Category and Above.

33. At the end of 2013 the Applicant's dates were set for the Position.

34. In 13 December 2013 the Applicant requested management evaluation of the management of the 8 is as well as the management evaluation of the 2 dated 21 February 2014.

35. In December 2014 a fast-track case was set up to investigate alleged

n#ne mont s and t8o 8ee0s %e".ant 8o%0 e7!e%#en\$e a\$9u#%ed afte% #s
-a\$ e"o%=s deg%ee and\$ en\$e\$ e fe"" s o%t of meet#ng t e m#n#mum of t %ee
2ea%\$= e7!e%#en\$e %e9u#%ed fo% t e Pos#t#on. Deta#"s of t #s s!e\$#f#\$ \$a"\$u"at#on a#e

\$. A"t oug E ; D/ as t e %es!ons#&#"#t2 to s\$%een a!!"#\$at#ons to an2 .a\$an\$25 t e %es!ons#&#"#t2 fo% s!e\$#f2#ng t e >o& %e9u#%ements' assess#ng \$and#dates and dete%#m#n#ng 8 # \$ edu\$at#on and/o% !%ofess#ona" att%#&utes 8ou"d &e \$ounted to8a%ds fu"#"#ng t e %e9u#%ements #s 8#t t e E#%#ng Damage%5 8 o as mo%e e7!e#t#se to dete%#m#ne 8 et e% a \$and#date meets t e %e9u#%ements. T e E#%#ng Damage% ne.e% %a#sed an2 \$on\$e%ns a&out t e A!!"#\$ant=s e"#g&#"#t2<

d. T e !%a\$t#%es and !%o\$edu%es of t e uman %esou%\$es se.#%es to s\$%een \$and#dates a%e su&>e\$t#.e and su&>e\$t to #nte%!%etat#on. T e !%e.#ous CCP ' at no !o#nt %e!o#ted an2 #m!%o!e% #nte%fe%en\$e #n t e !%o\$ess<

e. Ds. Haddou#a a!!"#ed)su&>e\$t#.e !%o\$esses* 8#t out su!!o#t#ng e% #nd#ngs 8#t "a 8s o% %egu"at#ons #n !"a\$e<

f. T e A!!"#\$ant !ossesses e7\$e!t#ona" 8o%0 e7!e#%en\$e fo% t e Pos#t#on and fu"#"s t e %e9u#%ed num&e% of 2ea% of e7!e#%en\$e. T e tota" 8o%0 e7!e#%en\$e amounts to 16 mont s at t e Un#ted Nat#ons De.e'o!ment Prog%amme,A\$#on fo% Coo!e#at#on and Trust !%o>e\$t ()UNDP,ACT*+ and fou% 2ea% and ten mont s 8#t Deuts\$ e Gese""s aft 1M% Te\$ n#s\$ e Nusammena%&e#t ()GTN*+< t at #s# s#7 2ea% t %ee mont s and t8o 8ee0s# #n add#t#on to #s e7!e#%en\$e #n UN13C4P. @.en #f #s \$onsu"tan\$2 8o%0 !e#%od #s %edu\$ed &2 50 J as &e#ng !a#t,t#me and #s G/,5 "e.e" e7!e#%en\$e #s d#s%ega%ded5 e st#" as t %ee 2ea%#s one mont and t8o 8ee0s

. The Applicant's evidence is based on the fact that the Respondent's position is that the Respondent is not a party to the contract. The Respondent's position is that the Respondent is not a party to the contract. The Respondent's position is that the Respondent is not a party to the contract.

#. The Respondent's position is that the Respondent is not a party to the contract. The Respondent's position is that the Respondent is not a party to the contract. The Respondent's position is that the Respondent is not a party to the contract.

>. The Applicant's evidence is based on the fact that the Respondent's position is that the Respondent is not a party to the contract. The Respondent's position is that the Respondent is not a party to the contract.

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/030

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/043

#..

/u!o%t5 ent#ed Delegation of Recruitment Authority and Responsibility for
)ational Professional 'fficers dated 13 ' \$to&e% 2006 ()2006 Demo%andum*+.

42. A"t oug Adm#n#st%at#.e 3nst%u\$#on /T/A3/2010/3 (/taff /e"e\$#on /2stem+5
8 # \$ a!!"#es to #nte%nat#ona" staff %e\$%u#tments e

46. The Tribunal has settled the matter as a dispute between the Administration and the complainant in the present case. It is not for the Tribunal to conduct an assessment of the administrative process on judgment to that of the Administration (e.g.)

ensu%e t at #nd#.#dua" a!"#\$Sants a%e e"#g#&"e o% not fo% a !a%t#\$u"a%
>o& o!en#ng5 unde% ea\$ e"#g#&"#t2 %u"e. As su\$ 5 t e ;e\$%u#te% as
t e aut o%#t2 to f#nd \$and#dates #ne"#g#&"e 8 en \$om!"#an\$e #ssues
a%e found5 at any stage of the process. (em! as#s added+

51. T e T%#&una" f#nds t at5 #n e% \$a!a\$#t2 as CCP' of UN13C4P5
Ds. Haddou%a 8as ent#t'ed to .e%#f2 8 et e% t e \$and#dates fo% t e Pos#t#on met
t e m#n#mum %e9u#%ements s!e\$#f#ed #n t e J' . / e 8as a"so &ound to \$o%#e\$#t an2
e%%o%#s d#s\$e.ed #n t e !%O\$ess.

'gan#Kat#on=s staff &e t e #g est standa%ds of eff#\$#en\$2\$ \$om!eten\$e and #nteg%#t2.

55. 3t fo""o8s t at t e ' %gan#Kat#on #s o&"#ged to ensu%e t at \$and#dates fu""2 meet a J' %e9u#%ements. 3t #s a"so o&"#ged\$ as a matte% of !%#n\$#!"e\$ to e7\$"ude t ose 8 o do not fu""2 meet t ose %e9u#%ements\$ e.en #f t e2 a%e #nte%na" \$and#dates and not fa% f%om meet#ng t em.

@7!e%#en\$e a\$9u#%ed #n t e G/ \$atego%2

56. Pa#a. 15 of t e 2006 Demo%andum states t at)e7!e%#en\$e #n t e Gene#a" /e% .#\$e \$atego%2 does not \$ount as !%ofess#ona" e7!

a\$9u#%ed #n a %e".ant f#e"d\$ su\$ as #s fou% mont s of se%.#Se 8#t CA/5 t e
se\$t#on 8 e%e t e Pos#t#on 8as. T #s 8o%0 does not 9ua"#f2 as)!%ofess#ona"*
e7!e%#en\$e\$ as %e9u#%ed &2 t e J ' 5 as #t 8as not at t e G/,6 o% a&o.e "e.e".

;e".ant f#e"d(s+ of e7!e%#en\$e

60. T e J ' \$"ea%"2 #nd#\$ated !u&"#\$ adm#n#st%at#on\$ go.e%nan\$e\$!ea\$e,&u#"d#ng\$
and \$ommun#t2 %e"at#ons as t e f#e"ds #n 8 # \$ \$and#dates to t e Pos#t#on 8e%e
e7!e\$ted to a.e a\$9u#%ed t e#% e7!e%#en\$e.

61. T e !%e%ogat#.e to "#m#t t %oug t e J' t e a%eas #n 8 # \$ e7!e%#en\$e 8ou"d
&e \$ons#de%ed %e".ant #s !a%t of t e ' %gan#Kat#on=s &%oad d#s\$et#on to dete%#m#ne
t e ne\$essa%2 %e9u#%ements fo% a g#.en !ost (see /hao/ /huang/ Lie

&"o8. @.en assum#ng t at #t 8e%e %e".ant\$ a "#tt"e mo%e of s#7 2ea%#n %e"at#.e"2
>un#o% !os#t#ons \$annot &e sa#d to amount to)e7\$e!t#ona"* e7!e%#en\$e.

65. 'n t ese &ases\$ t e T%#&una" f#nds t at t e A!!"#\$ant d#d not meet t e
edu\$at#on %e9u#%ement st#!u"ated #n t e J'.

A!!"#\$ant=s %e".ant !%ofess#ona" e7!e%#en\$e

66. T e A!!"#\$ant asse%ts t at t e Adm#n#st%at#on fa#"ed to ta0e #nto a\$ount #s
%e".ant !%ofess#ona" e7!e%#en\$e.

6A. Ea.#ng &een s!e\$#f#\$a""2 as0ed &2 t e T%#&una" fo% deta#"s of t at
e7!e%#en\$e\$ t e A!!"#\$ant \$#ted t e fo""o8#ng as %e".ant !ost,9ua"#f#\$at#on 8o%0
e7!e%#en\$e t at s ou"d a.e &een \$ounted:

- a. 1ou% 2ea%#s and ten mont s as 1%ee"an\$e 3nte% !%ete%#T%ans"ato%5 GTN<
79(7#% \$&

&. Various o&s #n C2!%us as a t%a#ne% and \$onsu"tant% !a%t,t#me #nst%u\$to% !u&"#\$ a8a%eness and \$a!a\$#t2 &u#"d#ng e7!e%t% ma%Oet#ng d#%e\$to% &u#ness de.e"o!ment manage% and d#%e\$to% and !u&"#\$ #nfo%mat#on and \$ommun#\$at#ons off#%e%.

6C. T e d#ffe%en\$e &et8een t e t8o \$a"\$u"at#ons a#ses &e\$ause t e Adm#n#st%at#on d#d not \$ount t e A!!"#\$ant=s 8o%0 as:

a. A Pu&"#\$ 3nfo%mat#on Ass#stant 8#t UN13C4P<

&. An 3nte%!%ete%/T%ans"ato% 8#t GTN< and

\$. A \$onsu"tant 8#t UNDP,ACT.

A0. As a"%ead2 ment#oned% t e e7!e%#en\$e at t e G/,5 "e.e" 8as not \$ounted as #t does not 9ua"#2 as)!%ofess#ona"* e7!e%#en\$e% #n "#ne 8#t t e %e"e.ant gu#de"#nes gene#a""2 a!!"#ed #n t e ' %gan#Kat#on s#n\$e 2012.

A1. T e A!!"#\$ant=s e7!e%#en\$e as 3nte%!%ete%/T%ans"ato% 8as deemed not %e"e.ant fo% t e Pos#t#on. ' n t e fa\$e of #t% #nte%!%etat#on/t%ans"at#on 8o%0% &2 #ts natu%e% #s not %e"e.ant to !%e!a%e a \$and#date fo% C#.#" Affa#%s and s ou"d not a.e &een #n\$#uded. T e A!!"#\$ant "\$a#ms t at du%#ng t #s !e%#od% e 8as)d#%e\$t"2 #n.o".ed* #n t e @U Ea%mon#Kat#on !%o\$ess of t e Tu%0#s ;e!u&"#\$ of No%t e%n C2!%us and 8o%Oed s!e\$#f#\$a""2 #n t e ag#%\$u"tu%e% tou%#sm% e\$onom2% en.%onment% t%ans!o%t% f#nan\$e% "a%ou% and ea"t se\$to%\$% 8 # \$ e !o#nted out #n #s PEP. Eo8e.e%\$ t e%e 8as no e.#den\$e !%esented to s o8% on t e one and% o8 "ong e 8as effe\$t#.e"2 #n.o".ed #n t #s !%o\$ess and% on t e ot e% and% t at #t 8as #n a mo%e su&stant#.e \$a!a\$#t2 t an t at of an 3nte%!%ete%/T%ans"ato%. 1o% t #s %eason% t e T%#&una" \$annot \$on\$#ude t at #t 8as #%at#ona" o% unfa#% fo% t e Adm#n#st%at#on to \$ons#de% t #s e7!e%#en\$e as #%e"e.ant.

A2. Bast"2% #s e7!e%#en\$e as a \$onsu"tant #n UNDP 8as a"so \$ons#de%ed #%e"e.ant as t e f#e"d of 8o%0 8as not one of t ose s!e\$#f#ed #n t e J'. T e T%#&una" f#nds t at #t #s %easona&"e to \$ons#de% t at)Ded#a ;e"at#ons* #s not suff#%ent"2 %e"ated to)!u&"#\$ adm#n#st%at#on% go.e%nan\$e% !ea\$e,&u#"d#ng% and \$ommun#t2 %e"at#ons*. T e A!!"#\$ant su&mits t at some of t e tas0s #n t #s

!os#t#on 8e%e .e%2 mu\$ #n "#ne 8#t CA/ dut#es. Eo8e.e%5 #t #s un\$"ea% to 8 at e7tent t ese fun\$t#ons \$onst#tuted an essent#a" !a%t of #s dut#es #n UNDP,ACT.

A3. -e2ond t at5 #t #s 8o%t not#ng t at t e A!!"#\$ant=s \$onsu"tan\$2 #n UNDP o.e%"a!!ed fo% #ts ent#%e du%at#on 8#t #s free"an\$e 8o%0 as 3nte%!"ete%/T%ans"ato%5 GTN5 and5 #n add#t#on5 #t o.e%"a!!ed fo% some ten mont s 8#t #s 8o%0 as P%o>e\$ Coor#d#nato% 8#t 3s0e"e,-ogaK 1#s e%men /o"#da%#t2 and De.e"o!ment Asso\$#at#on. 3n .#e8 of t #s5 #t #s un"#0e"2 t at t e \$onsu"tan\$2 at UNDP5 e.en #f found mate%#a""2 %e"e.ants \$ou"d a.e &een \$ounted at 100 J. And e.en #f #t ad &een5 t e A!!"#\$ant 8ou"d st#" a.e fa#"ed to %ea\$ t e %e9u#%ed t %ee 2ea%5 of e7!e%#en\$e< #ndeed5 one 2ea% and se.en mont s (#n U

A6. The Tribunal's decision is manifestly unreasonable and unfair in that it is based on a finding that the respondent's sense of urgency and fairness was not founded on the facts and circumstances of the case and that the respondent's conduct was not unreasonable.

AC. The Tribunal's decision is manifestly unreasonable in that it is based on a finding that the respondent's sense of urgency and fairness was not founded on the facts and circumstances of the case and that the respondent's conduct was not unreasonable.

60. The Tribunal has no evidence to suggest that Ms. Haddou's application of the Tribunal's standard of review was based on the facts and circumstances of the case.

61. The Tribunal's decision is manifestly unreasonable in that it is based on a finding that the respondent's sense of urgency and fairness was not founded on the facts and circumstances of the case and that the respondent's conduct was not unreasonable.

62. In the Tribunal's decision, it is found that the respondent's sense of urgency and fairness was not founded on the facts and circumstances of the case and that the respondent's conduct was not unreasonable.

Issue 3# Did the Applicant have a legitimate expectation to be found eligible to participate in the competitive selection exercise(

63. 3n

Conclusion

C3. In the event of the foregoing, the Tribunal shall:

The arbitrator shall be deemed to have accepted the award.

(Signed)

Judge Colonna / a8

Dated this 21st day of December 2015

Arbitrator's name; arbitrator's name this 21st day of December 2015

(Signed)

; enP D. Vargas D.5; arbitrator's name; enP D. Vargas D.5; arbitrator's name