

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

Introduction

1. The separate assessments conducted between 28 and 30 December 2014, e.g., the staff members and some staff members of the International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia (ICTY) (on the one hand) and the Ass'tant Secretary-General for Human Resources Management (A4G/9.6.7.8.23) decisions of June 2014 denoting

Case No.	UNDT/GVA/2014/085
	UNDT/GVA/2014/086
	UNDT/GVA/2014/087
	UNDT/GVA/2014/113
	UNDT/GVA/2014/114
	UNDT/GVA/2014/115
	UNDT/GVA/2014/122
	UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

10. -n June 2006+)# 4e(%eta%#5Gene%a&?s)u&&et'n 4T/4G "/2006/B

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

18. On 12 June and 16 August 2010, the -CT. The statement transmitted to the A4G/9678 the names of 448 employees, including those found suitable for (on/employment) -CT. and those employees who were recommended for the Acting Chief Human Resources Officer and the Chief of -CT. .

1B. On 31 August 2010, the Deputy Chief of the Administration, in the 4e(eta)Gene on)e, also the 4e(eta)Gene a\$so/ed the recommendations (outlined in the Report of the 48 CCJJJ-stress on the see \$a. 17 a) of the (including the recommendation that the 'g') -CT. should be considered for (on/employment to permanent assignments on a 't#) as's.

20. Based on the 'e' o! -CT. submissions of 12 June and 16 August 2010, 9678 disagreed with the -CT. recommendations and on 1B9(to)e 2010, submitted the matter to the Ne . oA Cent 7e/'e* 01C723)odesH name#; the C7 !o% 55 and D51 staff; the C7 !o% 52 to 54 staff; and the C7 !o% Gene 4e/'(e staff!. -n 'ts submission, 9678 stated that the Acting Chief Human Resources Officer and the Chief of the Administration should not be considered for the -CT. ?s recommendation of the permanent assignment. As grounds for the 'ts 'os't'on, 9678 stated that -CT. was a do*ns'E'ng ent't# and C*as) e:\$e(ted to (lose)# 2014 as set out in the latest Report on the (om\$et'on stateg# o! t,e T%)una 0A/65/5/Add.123 !o&&* 'ng t,e 4e(u't# CA . 8 74347(,) ?D-74347(,) -0. 922(%) 13 . 25 8 9

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

30. In accordance with the Assets Transfer Act (adopted
UNDT/2012/12B) and Judgment No. 2013/UNAT/5357 issued on
18 December 2013, the Assets Transfer Act, and that the sole
purpose of the Act is to ensure that the
assets of the State are managed in a
transparent and efficient manner, and that
the Act is intended to ensure that the
assets of the State are managed in a
transparent and efficient manner.

31.

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

34. -CT. (om\$'ted an 'nd'/'dua& !'&e !o% ea(, (on(e%ned sta!! mem)e%& 't
(om\$%'sed>

a. A so5(a&&ed memo .324 H(onta'n'ng t,e %e(ommendat'on !o%
(on/e's'on to \$e%manent a\$\$o'ntment)# -CT . management&

). A su\$\$kementa%# !a(t s,eet&

(. A \$e%sonne& a(t'on !o%m&

d. T,e %esults o! t,e -CT . Com\$a%at'/e 7e/'e* !o% t,e sta!! mem)e%?s
\$ost&

e. A&& \$e%!o%man(e e/a&uat'ons s'n(e t,e sta!! mem)e%?s a\$\$o'ntment
* 't, -CT . & and

!. An# add't'ona& 'n!o%mat'on t,at a sta!! mem)e% ,ad e&e(ted to \$%o/'de.

35. -CT. %e/'e*ed t,e A\$\$&'(ants? 'nd'/'dua& !'&es to assess t,e%' e&'g')'&'t# and
t,e%' su'ta)'&'t# and+ on 14 Fe)%ua%# 2014+ t%ansm'tted to 9 6 7 8 t,e !'&es+
toget,e% * 't, 'ts %e(ommendat'ons on ea(, (on(e%ned sta!! mem)e%. Fo% a&&
A\$\$&'(ants+ -CT. %e(ommended -e%ne C39 6523(()-30(,)aned27(e)-3 . 6 6 653(%)2 . 5731(e)-14 . 3249(d)-

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

36. "et*een Fe)%ua%# and 8 a# 2014+ t,e A\$\$k'(ants? !'kes *e%e e:am'ned)# t*o su((ess'/e %e/'e*e%e% *'t,'n 9 6 7 8+ seeA'ng !u%t,e% 'n!o%mat'on o% (&%!'(at'on !%om -CT. as needed. 9 6 7 8 %e(o%ded 'ts o)se%/at'ons on a ded'(ated standa% d !o%m and 't d'd not %e(ommand an# o! t,e (and'dates !o% (on/e%son@ t,e %e(o% d also s,o*s t,at a&t,oug, 9 6 7 8 ,ad 'n't'a&&# g'/en a \$ost'/e %e(ommandat'on (on(e'n'ng t,%ee -CT. sta!! mem)e% s ot,e% t,an t,e A\$\$k'(ants+ 't &ate% %e/e%sed 't)e!o%e t%ansm'tt'ng 't.

37. 9n 12 8 a%(, 2014+ t,e 7es\$ondent su)m'tted to t,e A\$\$eats T%')una& a mot'on !o% e:tens'on o! t'ime to e:e(ute 'ts <udgment?'s o%de% to (ons'de% -CT. sta!! mem)e% s !o% \$e%manent a\$\$o'ntments+ a&gu'ng t,at+ due to t,e (om\$ke: 't# o! t,e %e/'e* and t,e , 'g, /o&ume o! sta!! mem)e% s 'n/o&/ed+ 't *as not !eas')&e to (om\$&ete su(, (ons'de%at'on)e!o%e 1B June 2014. A!te% seeA'ng and o)ta'n'ng !u%t,e% 'n!o%mat'on on t,e 'm\$&ementat'on ste\$s unde%taAen t,us !a%+ t,e A\$\$eats T%')una&+)# 9%de% No. 178 020143 o! 2 A\$\$'k' 2014+ e:tended unt'k 1B June 2014 t,e 7es\$ondent?'s dead&'ne !o% (om\$&et'on o! t,e (on/e%son \$%o(ess.

38. -n 8 a# and June 2014+ t,e %e&e/ant Ne* . o%A C7)od'es %e/'e*ed a&& t,e !'kes o! t,e A\$\$k'(ants. T,e C7 Comm'ttee 0sta!! at t,e 52 to 54 &e/e&s3 %e(ommanded t,at none o! t,e A\$\$k'(ants)e g%anted \$e%manent a\$\$o'ntments+ * ,e%eas t,e C7 "oa% d %e(ommanded t,at n'ne sta!! mem)e% s at t,e 55 &e/e& and a)o/e+ amongst * ,om *e%e !ou% o! t,e A\$\$k'(ants+)e g%anted a \$e%manent a\$\$o'ntment not &'m'ted to -CT . .

3B. A!te% t,e C7)od'es? %e(ommandat'on+ t,e A4G/9 6 7 8 (ons'de%ed * ,et,e% o% not to g%ant t,e A\$\$k'(ants (on/e%son to a \$e%manent a\$\$o'ntment. -n do'ng so+ t,e ent'%e g%ou\$ o! -CT. sta!! mem)e% s t,at *as %e5(ons'de%ed !o% (on/e%son

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

Case No.

UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

m'n'mum+ t,e date o! %e!e%en(e s,ou&d)e 30 June 200B+ as t,e (utso!! date

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

Case No.	UNDT/GVA/2014/085
	UNDT/GVA/2014/086
	UNDT/GVA/2014/087
	UNDT/GVA/2014/113
	UNDT/GVA/2014/114
	UNDT/GVA/2014/115
	UNDT/GVA/2014/122
	UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

=.

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

... and the fact that the Commission's decision is final and binding on the parties. The Commission's decision is final and binding on the parties. The Commission's decision is final and binding on the parties.

... The Commission's decision is final and binding on the parties. The Commission's decision is final and binding on the parties. The Commission's decision is final and binding on the parties.

... The Commission's decision is final and binding on the parties. The Commission's decision is final and binding on the parties. The Commission's decision is final and binding on the parties.

... The Commission's decision is final and binding on the parties. The Commission's decision is final and binding on the parties. The Commission's decision is final and binding on the parties.

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

t. The Ass't (ants, a/e su!!e%ed mo%a& , a%m !o% t, e !undamenta&)%ea(,
o! t, e' (ont%a(tua& ent't&ements and t, e (ont'nu'ng)%ea(, o! \$%o(edu%a& due

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

39. The A4G/9678 was equated to take into account the interests and needs of the Organization, including, according to the General Assembly's guidance in the OSE at the least. The Tribunal's view is that the A4G/9678 was used, and the disbursement of the amount engaged in the educational activities. In the absence of a clear statement from the Assembly (and the evidence) that the OSE was intended to be used for the benefit of the Organization and not for the benefit of the State, the Tribunal finds that the disbursement was intended for the benefit of the Organization and not for the benefit of the State.

40. The evidence in this case shows that the Assembly (and the OSE) was established as a result of the OSE set out in A4G/2008/10 as well as the Guidance and according to the Assembly (and the OSE) was intended for the benefit of the Organization and not for the benefit of the State. The OSE was intended for the benefit of the Organization and not for the benefit of the State. The Tribunal finds that the disbursement was intended for the benefit of the Organization and not for the benefit of the State.

41. The Assembly (and the OSE) in Cases No. UNDT/GVA/2015/113 and 115 were intended as a staff member of 8-CT and recommended by the C7 Commission, the outcome would not be an immediate. Regarding the 55 State does not refer to the OSE (and the OSE) as well as the OSE to the OSE and the staff member to the State of 8-CT. Furthermore, the A4G/9678 guidance due regard to the C7 Commission's recommendations (concerning 55 and D51 Assembly (and the OSE) that, at the same time, the Commission does not indicate that the OSE is intended for the benefit of the Organization and not for the benefit of the State.

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

e. The Applicant's (ants) (e'/ed 'nd'/'dua&+ !u&& and !a'%) (ons'de%at'on !o% (on/e's'on to a \$e%manent a\$\$o'ntment. At t,e end o! t,e \$%o(ess+ ea(, A\$\$&'(ant %e(e'/ed a *%'tten+ %easoned and 'nd'/'dua& &ette% 'n!o%m'ng o! t,e A4G/9 6 7 8 %esult'ng de('s'on. T,e A4G/9 6 7 8 ga/e e/e%# %easona)le (ons'de%at'on to ea(, A\$\$&'(ant@ s,e %e/'e*ed ea(, s'ng&e (ase+ and t,e %e(o'd demonst%ates t,at a&& %e&e/ant (%'te%'a *e%e (ons'de%ed. T,e 'nd'/'dua&'sed (ons'de%at'on stems !%om t,e !'les (onta'n'ng t,e do(uments t,at led to t,e de('s'on. T,e %e 's no)as's !o% (ondu(t'ng a %e/'e* o! t,e 'm\$ugned de('s'ons %est%'(ted to t,e de('s'on &ette% 'tsek!+ 'nstead o! e:am'n'ng t,e de('s'on's maA'ng \$%o(ess as a * ,o&e+ as 's usua&&# done+ e.g.+ (on(e'n'ng sele(t'on de('s'ons. -n add't'on+ 'n

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

Admission of the applicant and the respondent (on the basis of the facts and circumstances of the case) is not in accordance with the provisions of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence of the Tribunal. The Tribunal finds that the applicant has not established that the respondent is a member of the organization in question. The Tribunal also finds that the applicant has not established that the respondent is a member of the organization in question. The Tribunal also finds that the applicant has not established that the respondent is a member of the organization in question.

.. The Tribunal finds that the respondent (on the basis of the facts and circumstances of the case) is not in accordance with the provisions of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence of the Tribunal. The Tribunal finds that the applicant has not established that the respondent is a member of the organization in question. The Tribunal also finds that the applicant has not established that the respondent is a member of the organization in question. The Tribunal also finds that the applicant has not established that the respondent is a member of the organization in question.

Case No.	UNDT/GVA/2014/085
	UNDT/GVA/2014/086
	UNDT/GVA/2014/087
	UNDT/GVA/2014/113
	UNDT/GVA/2014/114
	UNDT/GVA/2014/115
	UNDT/GVA/2014/122
	UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

m. K, 'the t, e 'm\$ementat'on o! t, e de('s'ons , ad to)e %et%oa(t' /e 0as
a&&ead# 'nd'(ated 'n t, e Gu'de&nes3+ t, e Adm'n'st%at'on *as ent't&ed to
(ons'de% an# !a(ts t, at o((u%%ed unt'& t, e date t, e de('s'on *as made. T, e
A\$\$eas T%)unak?s (ase &a* , as a((e\$ted t, at su)se=uent %e&e/ant
de/e&o\$ments \$e%ta'n'ng to e&'g')'&'t# and su'ta)'&'t# must)e taAen 'nto
a((ount. 6 ad t, e A\$\$eas T%)unak * 's, ed to set a g' /en (ut5o!! date !o% t, e
%e/ 'e*+ 't *ou&d , a/e s\$e('!'ed 't 'n 'ts Judgment. 8 o%eo/e%+ t, e A\$\$eas
T%)unak d'd not %a'se o)<(t'ons to t, e \$%o(ess * ,

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

* .

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

a. -CT. staff members are entitled to full and fair (onsideration of their
work (on/ess'ion to permanent assignment) as. 66+ 67 and 833

). The (on/ess'ion exercise) was demanded (onsideration
of their suitability) of the A\$S\$ (ants) as. 833

(. ;a(, (and date to) be re/vised (onsideration) as
a full# entitled to an and (onsidered assessment) o to
'nd'/'duat full and fair (onsideration) as. 66 and 673+ and 'n doing so
le/e# reasona)le (onsideration) ad to) be g'/en to -CT. staff members
demonstrating their
endeavouring to submit (a)ssess'ions) 't, 'n the 9-gan'Eat'on) as.
723 and

d. The A4G/9 678 was not entitled to seek# on their 'n'te mandate
of the -CT. I (6e)D d's(et'on) was lettered) #, e) seek'an(e) to their
e:(us'on) of all ot, e) seek'e/ant) a(to)s+ on their -CT.?'s 'n'te mandate
as. 683. The us+ their A4G/9 678 was not entitled to seek(e seek'an(e) on their
Go\$e'at'on) seek't'es) of their 9-gan'Eat'on?

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

64. 4e(. 1 o! 4T/4G "/200B/10 st'\$u&ates t,e ek'g')'t't# (ond't'ons as !o&to*s>

Eligibility

To)e ek'g')te !o% (ons'de%at'on !o% (on/e's'on to a \$e%manent a\$\$o'ntment unde% t,e \$%esent)u&&et'n+ a sta!! mem)e% must)# 30 June 200B>

0a3 6a/e (om\$&eted+ o% (om\$&ete+ !'/e #ea% s o! (ont'nuous se%/'(e on !':ed5te% m a\$\$o'ntments unde%

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

address * ,et,e% t,'s %e=u'%ement *as met at t,e t'me t,e (on(e%ned sta!!
mem)e% *as unde% t,e age o! 53@

). Demonst%at'on o! t,e , 'g, est standa%ds o! e!!('en(# (om\$eten(e and
'nteg%'t# esta)&'s,ed 'n t,e C,a%te%@

(. Demonst%at'on)# =ua&'!'(at'ons+ \$e%!o%man(e and (ondu(t o!
su'ta)'&'t# as 'nte%nat'ona& ('/'& se%/ants@ and

d. Dete% m'nat'on t,at t,e g%ant'ng o! a \$e%manent a\$\$o'ntment 's 'n
a((o%dan(e * 't, t,e 'nte%ests o! t,e 9%gan'Eat'on.

67. -n sum+ (%'te%'on 0a3 a)o/e en(om\$asses t,e t*o (ond't'ons
s\$e('!'ed 'n se(. 1 o! 4T/4G"/200B/10H'.e.+ !'!/e #eas o! (ont'nu'ng se%/'(e on

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

6B. The foregoing notwithstanding, it should be noted that the interest of the

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

7et%oa(t/'t#

72. A&t,oug, Judgment 20135UNAT5357 %e!e%\$ on se/e%a&
o((as'ons to %et%oa(t'/e 1(on/e%\$'on2 o% %et%oa(t'/e 1e!!e(t2 o! a \$otent'a&
(on/e%\$'on+ at \$a%a. 83Ht,e Ae# \$assage o! t,e 1Judgment2H't unam)'guous&#

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

75. The applicant's statement to the Tribunal, at the A\$Seals T')una& demanded the determination on (on/e's on a!te% %e/'e* 'ng and !'nd'ng !&*ed a s\$e('!(set o! adm'n'st'at'/e de('s'ons 'ssued)# t,e A4G/9 6 7 8 on 20 4e\$tem)e% 2011 and not!'ed to ea(, (on(e'ned sta!! on 6 9(to)e% 2011. T,e %emed'es o%de%ed)# t,e A\$Seals T')una& *e%e des'gned to %esto%e t,e A\$\$&'(ants? \$os't'on as 't *ou&d ,a/e)een)ut !o% t,e un&a* !u& de('s'ons. Conse=uent&#+ !o% t,e \$u\$ose o! t,e %e5 (ons'de%at'on e:e%('se+ t,e A\$\$&'(ants? su'ta)'&t# s,ou&d ,a/e)een a\$\$a'sed)# %e!e%en(e to t,e %e%e/ant ('%(umstan(es as t,e# stood at t,e t'me o! t,e !'st'm\$ugned %e!usa& to (on/e%t t,e% a\$\$o'ntments+ 'e.+ 'n t,e !a&& o! 2011.

76. -t !o&to*s t,at+ 'nasmu(, as t,e %e5(ons'de%at'on e:e%('se tooA 'nto a((ount+ 'nstead+ t,e !a(ts as o! t,e date o! t,e e/entua& de('s' on 0t,at 's+ m'd5June 20143+ t,e Adm'n'st'at'on !a'ked to (om\$&# *'t, t,e A\$Seals T')una&?s d'Ve(t'on to (a%%# out a (ons'de%at'on o! t,e A\$\$&'(ants? su'ta)'&t# !o% (on/e's' on.

-nd'/'dua& %e/'e* g'/'ng e/e%# %easona)&e (ons'de%at'on to t,e A\$\$&'(ants? \$%o!'('en('es+ (om\$eten('es and t%ans!e%%a)&e sa'&&s

77. T,e 7es\$ondent a/e% s t,at t,e %e5(ons'de%at'on e:e%('se (om\$'sed an 'nd'/'dua& (ons'de%at'on and %e/'e* o! t,e s\$e('!(=ua&'!'(at'ons+ \$%o!'('en('es+ \$e%!o%man(e+ (ondu(t and t%ans!e%%a)&e sa'&&s o! e/e%# A\$\$&'(ant. -n ,o&d'ng t,at+ ,e \$o'nts out t,at s': t#\$es o! de('s'ons *e%e 'ssued+ ea(, ta'&o%ed to t,e em\$&o#ment status o! t,e s': d'!!e%ent (atego%es o! s'm'&a&&# s'tuated sta!! mem)e%. T,e T')una& ,o*e/e%+ 's o! t,e /'e* t,at t,'s 'n 'tsek! does not %e/ea& an 'nd'/'dua&'sed (ons'de%at'on o! ea(, A\$\$&'(ant+)ut+ at)est+ t,e% (atego%'sat'on.

78. T,e 7es\$ondent also asse%ts t,at t,e A4G/9 6 7 8 e:am'ned t,e \$%o!'('en('es+ (om\$eten('es and t%ans!e%%a)&e sa'&&s \$e'ta'n'ng to ea(, 'nd'/'dua& A\$\$&'(ant. Ne/e%t,e&ess+ t,e T')una& (annot)ut note t,at t,e %easons g'/'en !o%

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

0 ka(ement aut, o't# outs'de t, e no%ma& \$%o(ess3 o! t, e adm'n'st%at' /e 'nst%u(t'on
's %e&e/ant+ as 't \$%o/'des t, at>

T, e Ass'stant 4e(%eta%#5Gene%a& !o% 6uman 7esou%(es
8 anagement s, a&& , a/e t, e aut, o't# to \$ka(e 'n a su'ta) &e \$os't'on
t, e !o&&o* 'ng sta!! mem)e's * , en 'n need o! \$ka(ement outs'de t, e
no%ma& \$%o(ess>

I

0)3 4ta!!+ ot, e% t, an sta!! mem)e's , o&d'ng a tem\$oa%#
a\$So'ntment+ a!!e(ted)# + 'n
a((o%dan(e * 't, 4ta!! 7u&e B.6 0(3 0'3 0em\$, as's added3.

86. -t 's note*o't, # t, at a)o&t'on o! \$osts o% !und'ng (ut)a(As a%e e:a(t&# t, e
s(ena%'os t, at (ou&d \$otent'a&&# a!!e(t t, e A\$\$&'(ants+ as -CT . sta!!+ \$utt'ng t, em
'n need o! a&te%nat' /e \$ka(ement. 4'n(e no* , e%e 'n t, e 'nst%u(t'on 't 's suggested
t, at oe1-0 . 9 602169 8 49 ()-429 60221(n)-0 .

Case No.

UNDT/GVA/2014/085

UNDT/GVA/2014/086

UNDT/GVA/2014/087

UNDT/GVA/2014/113

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

*e'g,t to t,e o\$e%at'onak %ea&t'es o! -CT. + 'n(ud'ng 'ts !'n'te mandate+ t,e
A\$\$eals T%)unak+ ne/e%t,e%ess+ s\$e('!(a&&# %u&ed 'n Judgment
2013:UNAT:5357 t,at %e&# 'ng on t,'s ('(umstan(e amounts to an
a)use o! d's(%et'on.

B6. 9n t,'s (%u('ak \$o'nt+ t,e T%)unak ,as dete% m'ned t,at t,e mot' /e to %e!use
to (on/e%t to \$e%manent t,e a\$\$o'ntments o! ea(, o! t,e e'g,t A\$\$k'(ants *as
'n/a%a)&# t,e same and (ame do*n to t,e !'n'te mandate o! -CT. and 'ts
do*ns'E'ng 0\$a%as. 82 to B1 a)o/e3+ and+ add't'onak&# t,at no ot,e% %e%e/ant
(%(umstan(es+ s\$e('!(to ea(, 'nd'/'dua&&# *e%e (ons'de%ed 0\$a%as. 77 to 81
a)o/e3. -t t,us a\$\$eals e/'dent t,at t,e \$edom'nant !a(to%)e, 'nd t,e 'm\$ugned
de('s'ons *as+ #et aga'n+ t,e !'n'te mandate o! -CT. .

B7. T,'s 's t,e /e%# same !a(to% on *,'(,+ as \$e% t,e A\$\$eals T%)unak?s %u& 'ng+
t,e Adm'n'st%at'on ,ad *%ong!u&&# %e&ed u\$on to t,e e:(&us'on o! an# ot,e%
(ons'de%at'ons. 6en(e+)# aga'n %e&# 'ng so&e&# on t,'s !a(to% and o/e%'d'ng a&&&
ot,e%# t,e 9%gan'Eat'on !a&ed to a)'de)# t,e (&ea% and)'nd'ng 'nst%u(t'ons
(ont'a'ned 'n Judgment 2013:UNAT:5357.

B8. -n summa%# t,e 'm\$ugned de('s'ons a&e un&a* !u& on se/e%at a((ounts+)ut
\$%'ma%'&# on t,e !o&&&* 'ng t*o>

a. T,e A\$\$k'(ants *e%e not (ons'de%ed 'nd'/'dua&&# 'n

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

BB. Art. 10.5 of the Treaty of the United Nations and the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women

As a result of the Tribunal's decision, the respondent is ordered to pay the applicant the amount of US\$ 10,000.

03 The Tribunal has found that the respondent's failure to pay the applicant the amount of US\$ 10,000 constitutes a violation of the respondent's obligations under the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women. The Tribunal has also set an amount of US\$ 10,000 as an award of interest on the sum of US\$ 10,000 to the applicant from the date of the respondent's failure to pay the sum of US\$ 10,000 to the applicant to the date of the Tribunal's decision.

03 Compensation for moral damage is not awarded in this case. The Tribunal has also found that the respondent's failure to pay the applicant the amount of US\$ 10,000 constitutes a violation of the respondent's obligations under the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women. The Tribunal has also set an amount of US\$ 10,000 as an award of interest on the sum of US\$ 10,000 to the applicant from the date of the respondent's failure to pay the sum of US\$ 10,000 to the applicant to the date of the Tribunal's decision.

100. The Tribunal has found that the respondent's failure to pay the applicant the amount of US\$ 10,000 constitutes a violation of the respondent's obligations under the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women.

Case No.

UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

As the applicant's assignments must stand (on the ground that the loss of the opportunity to sue is a permanent loss of the right to sue).

108. The applicant is not entitled to stand in the shoes of the respondent, as the respondent's assignment to the applicant is not a complete assignment. The respondent's assignment to the applicant is not a complete assignment because the respondent has reserved the right to sue. The respondent's assignment to the applicant is not a complete assignment because the respondent has reserved the right to sue.

a. No 'good' faith assessment must be conducted and

). The respondent's assignment to the applicant is not a complete assignment because the respondent has reserved the right to sue. (2011).

10B. The respondent's assignment to the applicant is not a complete assignment because the respondent has reserved the right to sue. The respondent's assignment to the applicant is not a complete assignment because the respondent has reserved the right to sue.

8.0 Damages

110. The respondent's assignment to the applicant is not a complete assignment because the respondent has reserved the right to sue. The respondent's assignment to the applicant is not a complete assignment because the respondent has reserved the right to sue.

As a result of its judgment, the Dispute Tribunal must order one of the following:

0a3 The respondent's assignment to the applicant is not a complete assignment because the respondent has reserved the right to sue. The respondent's assignment to the applicant is not a complete assignment because the respondent has reserved the right to sue.

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

Se!o%man(e o%de%ed+ su)<e(t to su)\$a%ag%a\$, 0)3 o! t,e \$%esent
\$a%ag%a\$,e

0)3 Com\$ensat'on +
* , '(, s,a&& no%ma&&# not e:(eed t,e e=u'/a&&ent o! t*o #ea%#? net
)ase sa&a%# o! t,e a\$\$&'(ant. T,e D's\$ute T%'')una&

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

30B. In this Judgment, the Appellate Tribunal has considered the nature of the grounds for awarding moral damages and held that a fundamental principle is that a state is not liable to pay moral damages unless it is shown that the state has acted in a manner that is manifestly unjust.

115. The state is not liable to pay moral damages unless it is shown that the state has acted in a manner that is manifestly unjust. The Appellate Tribunal has held that the state is not liable to pay moral damages unless it is shown that the state has acted in a manner that is manifestly unjust.

116. For the reasons outlined above, the Appellate Tribunal has held that the state is not liable to pay moral damages unless it is shown that the state has acted in a manner that is manifestly unjust. The Appellate Tribunal has held that the state is not liable to pay moral damages unless it is shown that the state has acted in a manner that is manifestly unjust.

The Appellate Tribunal has held that the state is not liable to pay moral damages unless it is shown that the state has acted in a manner that is manifestly unjust. The Appellate Tribunal has held that the state is not liable to pay moral damages unless it is shown that the state has acted in a manner that is manifestly unjust.

117. The Appellate Tribunal has held that the state is not liable to pay moral damages unless it is shown that the state has acted in a manner that is manifestly unjust. The Appellate Tribunal has held that the state is not liable to pay moral damages unless it is shown that the state has acted in a manner that is manifestly unjust.

118. In this Judgment, the Appellate Tribunal has held that the state is not liable to pay moral damages unless it is shown that the state has acted in a manner that is manifestly unjust. The Appellate Tribunal has held that the state is not liable to pay moral damages unless it is shown that the state has acted in a manner that is manifestly unjust.

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/085
UNDT/GVA/2014/086
UNDT/GVA/2014/087
UNDT/GVA/2014/113
UNDT/GVA/2014/114
UNDT/GVA/2014/115
UNDT/GVA/2014/122
UNDT/GVA/2014/147

Judgment No. UNDT/2015/116

(on/e's'onH'n t,e !a&& o! 2011 H *as add%essed 'n Judgment
20135UNAT5257 and (om\$ensated t,%oug, t,e damages o%de%ed t,e'e'n.

