Case No. UNDT/GVA/2015/135

Judgment No. UNDT/2016/042

6. T!\s a""\s\at\one{8}\at\one{8}\at\one{8}\at\one{8}\one{9}\defta on 20 3 a9 2015. T!e "'o\s\one{8}\one{8}\one{8}\one{9}

d. 4t!e' %#a\$ms/ and nota5#9 t!at !e 8as d\$s%'\$m\$nated aga\$nst 5e%ause !e \$s 5ased \$n :ang;o;/ !a.e no me'\$t/ as !e 8as e0%#uded f'om fu't!e' %ons\$de'at\$on 5e%ause !e d\$d not su5m\$t !\$s ans 8e' to t!e test.

## Consideration

- 14. : efo'e add'ess\$ng t!e me'\$ts of t!e %ase/ t!e T'\$5una# 8\$## 'u#e on a num5e' of mot\$ons su5m\$tted 59 t!e A""#\$%ant.
- 15. T!e A""#\$%ant 'e<uests t!at t!\$s %ase s!ou#d 'ema\$n 8\$t! t!e Judge to 8!om \$t !ad 5een \$n\$t\$a##9 ass\$gned/ and 8!o !as %ondu%t of a num5e' of ot!e' a""#\$%at\$ons !e !as f\$#ed. T!e T'\$5una# 'e=e%ts t!\$s mot\$on/ st'ess\$ng t!at t!e ass\$gnment of %ases to =udges \$s an \$nte'na# o'gan\$Eat\$ona# matte' and t!e "a't\$es !a.e no ent\$t#ement to a""ea' 5efo'e a "a't\$%u#a' =udge. 3 o'eo.e'/ t!e fa%t t!at d\$ffe'ent =udges ma9 'e.\$e8 .a'\$ous a""#\$%at\$ons #odged 59 t!e same a""#\$%ant does not affe%t t!e T'\$5una#Bs a5\$#\$t9 to %ons\$de'/ \$n ea%! %ase/ a## t!e fa%tua# and #ega# \$ssues t!at m\$g!t 5e 'e#e.ant to a dete'm\$nat\$on of t!e \$ssues \$n t!at "a't\$%u#a' %ase.
- 16. T!e motsons t!at a !ea'sng 5e !e#d 8\$t! a "a'ts%u#a' 8\$tness to 5e %a##ed and fo' #ea.e to f\$#e add\$t\$ona# 8'\$tten %omments a'e 'e=e%ted. T!e unso#\$%\$ted f\$#\$ng of 13 A"'\$# 2016 8\$## not 5e ta;en \$nto %ons\$de'at\$on. T!e T'\$5una# \$s of t!e .\$e8 t!at/ g\$.en t!e \$ssues at sta;e and t!e e.\$den%e on

\$n t!e \$nte'est of 'ea%!\$ng f\$na#\$t9 \$n d\$s"os\$ng of t!\$s "a't\$\u#a' 5one of \u00f8ontent\$on. -o8e.e'/ and \$nsofa' as !e m\u00e4g!t 5e deemed to 5e \u00e8n\u00e4tud\u00e\$ng a \u00e8!a\u00e4enge to t!e \u00e8nte'med\u00e8a'9 o' "'e"a'ato'9 'e<u\u00e8'ement t!at t!e 8 '\u00e8tten test ans 8 e's 5e t9"ed/ t!e a""\u00e4\u00e8at\u00e8on 8ou\u00e4d not 5e 'e\u00e8\u00e8.a5\u00e4e \u00e8n an9 e.ent (see 2011)UNAT)152\u00e8/\u00e8n a\u00e8o'dan\u00e8e 8\u00e8t! a't. 2.1(a\u00e8 of t!e T'\u00e85una\u00e4Bs , tatute and t!e 'e\u00e4ated =u'\u00e8s"'uden\u00e8e on 8!at \u00e8onst\u00e8tutes an a""ea\u00e4a5\u00e4e adm\u00e8n\u00e8t'at\u00e8.e de\u00e8s\u00e8on (2010)UNAT)030/\u00e9 2010)UNAT)013/\u00e9 2013)
UNAT)304/ endo's\u00e8ng t!e def\u00e8n\u00e8t\u00e8on ado"ted \u00e8n t!e fo'me' Un\u00e8ted Nat\u00e8ons Adm\u00e8n\u00e8t'at\u00e8.e T'\u00e85una\u00e4 Judgment No. 115\u00e9/\u00e9/\u00e902003\u00e8\*/ name\u00e49

>a? un\$#ate'a# de\$\$\$on ta;en 59 t!e adm\$n\$\$t'at\$on \$n a "'e\$\$se \$nd\$.\$dua# %ase (<math>\$nd\$.\$dua# adm<math>\$n\$\$st'at\$.e a\$t\*/ 8 !\$%! "'odu\$8e d\$'e\$t #ega# %onse<uen%es to t!e #ega# o'de'.

1. A## s!o't#\$sted %and\$dates 8e'e 'e<uested to ta;e a 8'\$tten test t!at \$n.o#.ed t9"\$ng t!e ans 8e's to t8o <uest\$ons des\$gned to assess s;\$##s \$n &uss\$an 'e.\$s\$on. T!e A""#\$%ant d\$d not su5m\$t !\$s ans 8e's 5e%ause !e %ons\$de'ed t!at t!e Adm\$n\$st'at\$on 8as not ent\$t#ed to \$m"ose on !\$m a

not 'efe''ed to an9 'u#e "'es%'\\$5\ng t!at t!e met!odo#og9 used fo' a test must ne\"essa'\\$\#9 'e"\#\%ate t!e \\$nte'na\# 8 o'; f\#0 8 s.

21. T!e T'\$5una# !as 'u#ed "'e.\$ous#9 t!at %and\$dates \$n a se#e%t\$on "'o%ess must %om"#9 8\$t! t!e \$nst'u%t\$ons g\$.en fo' a 8'\$tten test/ and ta;e "e'sona# 'es"ons\$5\$#\$t9 fo' ma;\$ng t!e ne%essa'9 a''angements to meet t!e 'e<u\$'ements fo' su%! %om"#\$an%e. Ga\$#u'e to do so ma9 "'o"e'#9 #ead to t!e\$' e0%#us\$on f'om t!e 'e%'u\$tment "'o%ess ( UNDT/2013/030\*. T!e on#9 a""#\$%a5#e 'e<u\$'ement \$s t!at t!e met!odo#og9 of t!e tests 5e fa\$' and 'easona5#e and not des\$gned de#\$5e'ate#9 to %onfe' an ad.antage on a "'efe''ed %and\$date o'/ a#te'nat\$.e#9/ to d\$sad.antage a "a't\$%u#a' %and\$date/ 8!o ma9 t!en %!a##enge t!e de%\$s\$on 59 f\$#\$ng a %#a\$m a##eg\$ng t!at t!e'e !as 5een a mate'\$a# \$''egu#a'\$t9 \$n t!e se#e%t\$on "'o%ess. A""#9\$ng t!at "'\$n%\$"#e to t!\$s %ase/ t!e T'\$5una# f\$nds t!at t!e Adm\$n\$st'at\$onBs de%\$s\$on 'e<u\$'\$ng 'e#at\$.e#9 sen\$o' s"e%\$a#\$sts \$n t!e &uss\$an #anguage to 5e a5#e to t9"e \$n &uss\$an \$s 8\$t!\$n t!e d\$s%'et\$on a##o 8 ed to t!e Adm\$n\$st'at\$on and/

## Judgment

- 25. 7t \$s t!e Judgment of t!e T'\$5una# t!at t!e'e \$s no me'\$t \$n t!e %ontent\$ons ad.an%ed 59 t!e A""#\$%ant.
- 26. T!e a" "#\$%at\$on fa\$#s and \$s 'e=e%ted.

( \*
Judge Goo#am 3 ee'an
Dated t!\$s 26<sup>t!</sup> da9 of A"'\$# 2016