



1. ! a""#\$%at\$on f\$#ed on 28 August 2015& t'e A""#\$%ant& a staff mem(e) of

"Promotions to the P02 level are considered 90% of the basis of  
the qualifications of the staff member(s).

5.

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2015/158

Judgment No. UNDT/2016/056

t'e P02 #e3e#k 9 '\$% ' & 'e de%\$dedk 9ou#d (e e6ua##!

1<. ! memo)andum dated 2 ; a)%' 2015 and d\$st)\$ (uted to a## t'e UN \*C+ staff mem(e)s 3\$a ema\$# on 1 ; a)%' 2015; t'e \*\$g' Comm\$ss\$one) announ%ed '\$s de%\$s\$ons fo##o9\$ng t'e )e%ou)se sess\$on. T'e A""#\$%ant 9as not among t'e %and\$dates ")omoted u"on )e%ou)se.

20. =n 1 ; a! 2015; t'e A""#\$%ant su(m\$ttd to t'e De"ut! \*\$g' Comm\$ss\$one) a )e6uest fo) management e3a#uat\$on of t'e de%\$s\$on not to ")omote 'e) to t'e P02 #e3e#.

21. =n 1 June 2015; t'e A""#\$%ant )e%e\$3ed an \$nte)\$m )es"onse \$nfo)m\$ng 'e) t'at 'e) )e6uest fo) management e3a#uat\$on 9as st\$## unde) %ons\$de)at\$on. 4'e d\$d not )e%e\$3e an! fu)t'e) )es"onse.

22. T'e A""#\$%ant f\$#ed 'e) a""#\$%at\$on 9\$t' t'e +eg\$st)! of t'\$s T)\$ (una# on 28 August 2015.

21. T'e +es"ondent su(m\$ttd '\$s )e"#! on 2 =%(e) 2015.

22. 8)om 21 to 26 Janua)! 2016; t'e T)\$ (una# 'e#d a 'ea)\$ng on t'e me)\$ts of t'e \$nstant %ase; :o\$nt#! 9\$t' s\$F ot'e) %ases %'a##eng\$ng %ontem"o)aneous de%\$s\$ons and )a\$s\$ng s\$m\$#a) \$ssues; name#! Cases Nos. UNDT/GVA/2015/076 ,T\$one3a/; UNDT/GVA/2015/112 ,Natta/; UNDT/GVA/2015/157 ,De #a Va)ga 8\$to/; UNDT/GVA/2015/161 ,4"annut' Ve)ma/ UNDT/GVA/2015/165 ,+od)\$gue70 V\$6ue7/ and UNDT/GVA/2015/166 ,; uft\$%/ . 8\$3e 9\$tnesses f)om t'e D\*+ ; 9e)e 'ea)dA t'e \*ead of t'e \*uman +esou)%es Po#\$%! and P#ann\$ng 4e)3\$%et t'e C'ef of t'e Ass\$gnments and P)omot\$ons 4e%t\$on; t' Cemgut

me)3e3 395-0.

26. During the course of the proceedings, the respondent filed a number of documents ex parte. The Tribunal made a finding that these actions were taken in order to influence the proceedings as necessary and on an undue basis.

27. The Tribunal's findings are as follows:

a. The UN\* C+ Commission members' statements that the UN\* C+ staff



2. The UN\* C+ fa\$hed to %ons\$de) t'e mat'emat\$a# and s



Case No. UNDT/GVA/2015/158

Judgment No. UNDT/2016/056

(.

staff and did not "represent separate sexes" of female and male  
and dates during the 4000+ years. Hence, the texts constituted a



Case No. UNDT/GVA/2015/158

Judgment No. UNDT/2016/056

2<

11.

,\$\$/

8o) " )omotion to an! #e3e#  
and "a)t\$%u#a)#! to t'e P05 #e3e# and a(o3e# a staff mem(e)







%o))e%t#! a""#sed. I 'e)eas t'e)e \$s no dou(t t't'at t'e T)\$ (una# 'as no aut'o)\$t! -to  
amend an! )egu#at\$on o) )u#e of t'e =)gan\$7at\$on. , \$e#touche 20100UNAT0025k  
"a)a. 11/k a de%\$s\$on ma! (e )es%\$nded \$f \$t \$s ta?en "u)suant to a "o#\$%! 9 '\$%'  
does not %om"#! 9\$t' a '\$g'e) no)m. 5n t'\$s %ontefT& t'e T)\$ (una# ma! a#so -"o\$nt  
out 9 'at \$t 1256(m)-0.0858734(a)-35nu#

se"ate#! f)om t'e 4e%ond +ound on 9a)ds as not' \$ng \$n t'e P)omot\$ons Po#\$%!  
")e3ented \$t.

50. 5t 'as (een esta(#\$s'ed t'at fema#e and ma#e %and\$dates fo) ")omot\$on 9e)e  
%ons\$de)ed \$n t'9o se"ate g)ou"s \$n t'e 4e%ond and T'\$)d +ounds# head\$ng t'e  
Pane# to )e%ommend& and u#t\$mate#! t'e \*\$g' Comm\$\$\$one) to se#e%t& an e6ua#  
num(e) of fema#e and ma#e staff mem(e)s. ; o)e s"e%\$f\$a#!& \$t a""ea)s t'at afte)  
'a3\$ng \$dent\$fed t'e %and\$dates 9'o 'ad "assed t'e 8\$)st +ound& t'e D\*+ ;

9 'e)e se%. 5.10.2 ")o3\$des t'at -BaCt g)ade #e3e#s 9 'e)e gende) "a)t! 'as not !et  
(een a%'\$e3edk at #east 50E of t'e ")omot\$on s#ots 9\$## (e a9a)ded to  
su(stant\$a##! e6ua##! me)\$to)\$ous fema#e staff..

51. 4\$gn\$f\$%ant#!& t'e P)omot\$ons Po#\$%! %ons\$stent#! )efe)s to t'e %om"a)at\$3e  
assessment and )an?\$ng of a s\$ng#e "oo# of %and\$dat

g)ou" \$n t'e 4e%ond +ound to ")odu%e a #sst of -su(stant\$a##! e6ua##! me)\$to)\$ous.  
%and\$dates fo) %ons\$de)at\$son (! t'e Pane# \$n t'e T'\$)d +ound.

56. 8u)t'e)mo)e& t'e T)\$ (una# \$s of t'e 3\$e9 t'at t'e \*\$g' Comm\$ss\$one)@s  
de%\$s\$son to set t'e a3a\$a(#e num(e of ")omot\$on s#ots fo) fema#e and ma#e  
%and\$dates (efo) t'e a%tua# ")omot\$ons sess\$on 9as %om"#eted& )at'e) t'an at t'e  
t\$me of a9a)d\$ng ")omot\$ons& a#so )a\$ses some %on%e)ns.

57. T'e \*\$g' Comm\$ss\$one)@s "o9e) to set t'e num(e of a3a\$a(#e ")omot\$on  
s#ots \$s def\$ned \$n se%. 2.1.2 of t'e P)omot\$ons Po#\$\$!& 9 '\$\$ ' ")o3\$desA

BT'eC D\$3\$ss\$on of \*uman +esou)es ; anagement ,D\* + ; / 9\$##  
su(m\$t to t'e Jo\$nt Ad3\$so) Comm\$ttee ,JAC/& at #east 10 9o)?\$ng  
da!s ")o) to t'e )e#e3ant ")omot\$ons sess\$on& \$ts )e%ommendat\$ons  
on t'e num(e of a3a\$a(#e ")omot\$on s#ots us\$ng )e#e3ant stat\$st\$\$s  
on "os\$t\$ons and staff\$ng& \$n%#ud\$ng (ut not #m\$sted to& d\$st)\$ (ut\$ons  
(! g)ade #e3e## eF"e%ted se"a)at\$on and )e%)u\$tmnt and t)ends \$n  
\$nte)agen%! eF"anges. T'e num(e of ")omot\$on o""o)tun\$ts&  
)ef#e%ted 6uant\$stat\$3e#! as ")omot\$on s#ots& 9\$## (e de%ded (! t'e  
\*\$g' Comm\$ss\$one) & ta?\$ng \$nto a%ount t'e ad3\$e of t'e JAC.

58. A(sent an!) )efe)en%e \$n t'\$s ")o3\$ss\$on to gende) %ons\$de)at\$ons& t'e \*\$g'  
Comm\$ss\$one)@s d\$s%)et\$on \$s #m\$sted& at t'\$s stage& to dete)m\$n\$ng t'e num(e of  
a3a\$a(#e s#ots fo) ")omot\$on at ea%' #e3e## (ased on t'e UN\*C+@s staff\$ng ta(#e  
and staff mo3ements ")ognost\$\$s. A#t'oug' t'e \*\$g' Comm\$ss\$one) ma! 'a3e  
soug't to a%'e3e gende) "a)\$t! \$n sett\$ng \$n ad3an%e t'e num(e of s#ots a3a\$a(#e  
fo) ea%' gende) g)ou"& 9 '\$\$ ' \$s most %e)ta\$n#! a %ommenda(#e and #a9fu#  
o(:e)t\$3e \$n #g't of t'e UN C'a)te) and t'e -Po#\$\$! on A%'e3\$ng Gende) H6u\$t!  
\$n UN\*C+ staff\$ng. ,5= ; 018/2007 J 8= ; 01</2007/ of 8 ; a)%' 2007  
, -Gende) Po#\$\$!./ ,see \$e#tuche UNDT/200</01<& "a)a. 17/& 'e ended u"  
ma?\$ng a ")edete)m\$n\$at\$on of \$ssues t'at 'ad to (e add)essed at a #ate) stage& t'at  
\$s& at t'e t\$me of a9a)d\$ng t'e ")omot\$ons& afte) t'e e3a#uat\$on of t'e %and\$dates  
'ad a\$guant\$ ta)onga389e79e@#6.66#8(fu#146(o)9.69979\$g

5<. 5n t'\$s )es"e%t& t'e T)\$ (una# st)esses t'at t'e P)omot\$ons Po#% ! does not  
")o3\$de fo) ")omot\$on 6uotas (ased on gende)& as seemed to (e %ons\$de)ed (! t'e  
\*\$g' Comm\$ss\$one). +at'e)& \$t ")o3\$des fo) a

61. In 2009 of the following the T (understands that the situation of female and male and dates for the "a" assessment and )an?ing at the 4e%ond

t'e s%o)es fo) ea% ' o(:e%t\$3e 9e)e t'en %om(\$ned (! t'e s!stem to gene)ate an  
o3e)a## 9o)? "e)fo)man%e )at\$ng on 9o)? o(:e%t\$3esA

\$. Not A%'\$e3ed 1& 2

\$\$ Pa)t\$a##! A%'\$e3ed 1& 2& 5





Case No. UNDT/GVA/2015/158

Judgment No. UNDT/2016/056

75. The Panel states that the management's actions (as demonstrated by the fact that the PA+/ePAD "e)fo)man%e e3a#uat\$ons and 8a%t 4 'eet na))at\$3e.. The "e)fo)man%e e3a#uat\$on \$s 9\$'t'out an! dou(t t'e one found \$n t'e e0PAD& 9 '\$%' %ons\$sts not on#! of t'e na))at\$3e& (ut a#so of t'e )at\$ngs of 9o)? o(:e%t\$3es and %om"eten%\$es. T'e T)\$ (una# notes t'at t'e st)u%tu)e of t'e o(\$gat\$on unde) se%. 5.<.1,\$\$/ to %ons\$de) mate)\$a# \$s d\$ffe)ent f)om t'at \$n se%. 5.<.1,\$\$/ +at'e) t'an )efe))ng to t'e %ons\$de)at\$on of t'e na))at\$3e \$n (ot' t'e e0PAD and t'e fa%t s'ee%t& se%. 5.<.1,\$\$/ %onta\$ns a %ea) d\$stn%t\$on (et9een t'at 9 '\$%' '\$)e)fe)ted \$n t'e PA+/e0PAD "e)fo)man%e e3a#uat\$ons and t'at )ef#e)ted \$n fa%t s'ee%t na))at\$3e. T'e 9o)ds - "e)fo)man%e e3a#uat\$on. atta%' to t'e PA+ and t'e e0PAD& 9 '\$#e t'e 9o)d -na))at\$3e. atta%'es to t'e fa%t s'ee%t. C#ea)#!& \$n #g't of t'e unam(\$guous 9o)d\$ng of t'\$s ")o3\$sson& \$t \$s f)om (ot' t'e e0PAD "e)fo)man%e e3a#uat\$ons and t'e fa%t s'ee%t na))at\$3e t'at t'e assessment 'ad to (e made \$n )es"e%t of t'e -manage)\$a# a%' \$e3ements..

76. The respondent's argument that se%. 5.<.1 s'ou#d (e \$nte)"eted \$n su%' a 9a! t'at t'e e0PAD and t'e fa%t s'ee%t )efe) to t'e same do%ument& name#! t'e fa%t s'ee%t a#one& must (e )e:e%ted as \$t 'as (een %ea)#! esta(#\$s'ed t'at t'e fa%t s'ee%t does not ent\$e#! )ef#e) t'e e0PADs (e%ause \$t does not )e")odu%e t'e )at\$ngs %onta\$ned \$n t'e #atte). 5f \$t 'ad (een \$ntended to )efe) on#! to t'e na))at\$3e& t'en t'e P)omot\$ons Po#\$\$! 'ad to (e d)afted to so s"e%\$f! t'\$s. 5t \$s a#so %ea) f)om t'e P)omot\$ons Po#\$\$! t'at t'e \$nfo)mat\$on %onta\$ned \$n t'e e0PADs& \$n#ud\$ng t'e )at\$ngs& 9as d\$e%t#! )e#e3ant to t'e Pane# mem(e)s& assessment du)\$ng t'e 4e%ond +ound.

77. 8)\$st#!& se%. 5.<.1,\$/ )e6u\$ed t'e Pane# mem(e)s to assess 9 'et'e) t'e staff mem(e)s "e)fo)man%e met t'e m\$nmum t'es'o#d of -A%' \$e3ed. o) \$ts e6u\$3a#ent fo) o3e)a## 9o)? o(:e%t\$3es& and -P)ofs\$ent. o) \$ts e6u\$3a#ent fo) o3e)a## %om"eten%\$es. T'ese "e)fo)man%e t'es'o#ds d\$e%t#! )efe) to t'e )at\$ngs )ef#e)ted \$n t'e e0PADs& as "e) t'e PA ; 4. I \$t'out (e\$ng ")o3\$ded su%' )at\$ngs& t'e Pane# mem(e)s 9e) not \$n a "os\$on to 3e)\$f! 5f t'e m\$nmum )e6u\$ements set fo)t' \$n se%. 5.<.1,\$/ 9e) met.



81. It is a "a)ent f)om t'e %onso#dated ta(#es of )an?#ngs of %and\$dates fo)

"o3\$des \$n \$ts se%. 16 t'at -A% 'se3ed. and -P)of\$\$ent. %o))es"ond to a )at\$ng  
(et9een 5.1 and 8.0k 9 '\$%' a#so seems to (e t'e "os\$t\$on ado"ted (! t'e D\* + ; k  
as "e) t'e (oad%ast sent on 18 ; a! 2011 ,see "a)a. 71 a(o3e/. T'e T)\$ (una#  
%annot )e%on%\$#e t'ese t9o a""a)ent# ! %ont)ad\$%to)! "o3\$\$ons of t'e PA ; 4 and k  
g\$3en t'at \$t \$s not dete)m\$nat\$3e of t'e ")esent a""#\$%at\$onk 9\$## #m\$t \$tse#f to











Case No.

UNDT/GVA/2015/158



mem(e)s se%t\$on& 'e 9ou#d 'a3e& o) not& a (ette) % 'an%e of )e%e\$3\$ng a '\$g'  
)an?\$ng. 5n t'\$s )es"e%t& \$t \$s fut'e) noted t'at fou) Pane# mem(e)s 9e)e se#e%ted  
(! t'e Adm\$n\$st)at\$on and fou) (! t'e staff mem(e)s

of 9 'et'e) o) not t'e Pane# mem(e)s d\$d a%tua##! %ons\$de) t'\$s %)ste)\$on \$n t'es\$) %om"a)at\$3e assessment of t'e %and\$dates. T'e ")esum"t\$on of )egu#a)\$t! atta%'ed to t'e a%ts of t'e Adm\$n\$st)at\$on 'as (een )e(uttedk and \$t 9as fo) t'e +es"ondent to addu%e e3\$den%e t'at t'e Pane# mem(e)s d\$d not ta?e \$nto a%%ount t'\$s \$))e#e3ant e3a#uat\$on %)ste)\$on. Not on#! t'e +es"ondent d\$d not addu%e e3\$den%e \$n t'\$s )es"e%tk (ut 'e )at'e) \$ns\$sted t'at t'\$s 9as a ")o"e) fa%to) fo) %ons\$de)at\$on.

Use of "e)sona# ?no9#edge

110. T'e A""#\$%ant ta?es \$ssue 9\$t' t'e fa%t t'at t'e D\*+ ; \$n3\$ted t'e Pane# mem(e)s to ta?e \$nto %ons\$de)at\$on t'e\$) "e)sona# ?





Case No. UNDT/GVA/2015/158

Judgment No. UNDT/2016/056



121. A t's) Pane# mem(e) a#so s!stemats\$a##! )an?ed %and\$dates 9\$t '\$n a gou" and \$ndeed ass\$gn\$ng t'e same )an?\$ng to u" to 25 %and\$dates. \*e )an?ed 10 %and\$dates num(e) 1& 11 %and\$dates num(e) 11& 11 %and\$dates num(e) 22& 8 %and\$dates num(e) 11& 10 %and\$dates num(e) 21& 10 %and\$dates num(e) 51& < %and\$dates num(e) 61& 12 %and\$dates num(e) 70& 22 %and\$dates num(e) 82& 15 %and\$dates num(e) 105& 25 %and\$dates num(e) 118& 1 %and\$date num(e) 11<& 22 %and\$dates num(e) 121 and 20 %and\$dates num(e) 162. \*e a#so %omm\$tted e))o)s \$n ass\$gn\$ng t'e neFt )an?\$ng fo##o9\$ng a gou"\$ng& fo) \$nstan%ek (! )an?\$ng 25 %and\$dates num(e) 118 and t'en ass\$gn\$ng t'e neFt %and\$date num(e) 11<& \$nstead of num(e) 121. A#so& t'\$s Pane# mem(e) d\$d not ass\$gn a )an?\$ng '\$g'e) t'an 162 to an! %and\$date. ! not ass\$gn\$ng t'e #ast )an?\$ngs to an! %and\$dates& t'\$s Pane# mem(e) ne%essa)\$#! 'ad a d\$ffe)ent \$m"a%t on t'e %and\$dates@ a3e)age.

122. A fou)t' Pane# mem(e) a#so )an?ed a#most a## %and\$dates \$n a gou" of 10. 5n "a)t\$%u#a)& t'\$s Pane# mem(e) )an?ed 11 %and\$dates num(e) 1& 10 %and\$dates num(e) 11& 5 %and\$dates num(e) 21& 10 %and\$dates num(e) 27& 11 %and\$dates num(e) 17& 10 %and\$dates num(e) 28& 10 %and\$dates num(e) 2<& 10 %and\$dates num(e) 5<& 6 %and\$dates num(e) 6<& 6 %and\$dates num(e) 75& 10 %and\$dates num(e) 81& 16 %and\$dates num(e) <1& 10 %and\$dates num(e) 107& 12 %and\$dates num(e) 117& 10 %and\$dates num(e) 111& 8 %and\$dates num(e) 121& 2 %and\$dates num(e) 12<& 10 %and\$dates num(e) 152 and 16 %and\$dates num(e) 162. 5n t'\$s ")o%ess& 'e %omm\$tted se3e)a# e))o)s \$n t'e a""#\$%at\$on of t'e suggested met'odo#og!& (! not ass\$gn\$ng %o)e%t#! t'e neFt )an?\$ng. Amongst ot'e)s& 'e )an?ed 10 %and\$dates num(e) 28 and t'e neFt ten %and\$dates num(e) 2<& a#t'oug' t'e! s'ou#d 'a3e (een )an?ed num(e) 58. ; ost s\$gn\$f\$%ant#!& t'\$s Pane# mem(e) )an?ed 128 %and\$dates (e#o9 120& 9 '\$%' \$s t'e t')es'o#d to ad3an%e to t'e T'\$)d +ound. \*e ga3e t'\$s (nef\$t to mo)e %and\$dates t'at t'e Po#\$% ! a##o9ed '\$m to do. >\$?e t'e ")e3\$ous Pane# mem(e)& 'e )an?ed no %and\$date '\$g'e) t'an 162.

121. A f\$ft' Pane# mem(e) a#so )an?ed %and\$dates \$n gou"s of a m\$n\$mum of t9o "eo"#ek gou"\$ng u" to 11 "eo"#e toget'e). 5n t'\$s ")o%ess& 'e a#so %omm\$tted a num(e) of e))o)s \$n ass\$gn\$ng t'e neFt )an? fo##o9\$ng a gou"\$ng. 8u)t'e)mo)ek



Case No.

UNDT/GVA/2015/158

ne%essa)! to get ")ofess\$ona# ad3\$%e g\$3en t'e "otent\$a# \$m"a%t of t'e ")o"osed  
met'odo#og! on t'e %and\$dates@ o3e)a## )an?\$ng.

128. T'e T)\$ (una# %annot (ut 9onde) 'o9 and 9 '! se3en of t'e e\$g't Pane#  
mem(e)s ended u" g)ou"\$ng a#most a## %and\$dates 9\$t'\$n a g)ou" of 10 o)  
t'ea(out. I as \$t ag)eed u"onM 5f not& 9 'at 9e) t'e %)ste)\$a used to d\$3\$de t'e  
%and\$dates \$nto su%' g)ou"sM T'e)e \$s a d\$ffe)en%e (et9een ass\$gn\$ng t'e same  
)an?\$ng to t9o o) mo)e %and\$dates 9 'o a)e -und\$st\$ngu\$s'a(#e.& as suggested (!  
t'e D\*+ ; & and engag\$ng \$n a g)ou"\$ng eFe)%\$se. T'e )an?\$ng ")o%ess t'at most













121. The Applicant also alluded to other "osses" (losses) more specifically to the Panel members taking into consideration the "ersonal" knowledge of and dates to a failure to suffer from the defendant's estate and to the share of the tax. The Taxpayer's affidavit addressed the first factor and the 'S' indeed would "oss" (lose) some outflow) and things and demonstrate that the admissibility of the D\* + ; generated tangibles (revenue) of the Taxpayer's family to add to the suggested factors in turn.

122. As evidenced by the fact that the Taxpayer's affidavit to

defined. That (e)ng said t'e T)(una# 9 '\$%' ' as (! no9 eFam\$ned t'e 4e%ond +ound )e3\$e9 unde)ta?en (! t'e 4en\$) P)omot\$ons Pane# ,see# e.g.# Rodriguez-Viquez fo) ma#e %and\$dates fo) ")omot\$on to t'e P05 #e3e#G !pannuth Verma UNDT/2016/021 fo) fema#e %and\$dates fo) ")omot\$on to t'e P05 #e3e#/# and# 9\$' t'\$s %ase# t'at (! t'e Pane# \$s '\$g'#! %on%e)ned t'at \$t ma! (e s\$m"#! \$m"oss\$(#e# \$n ")a%t\$e# to fa\$)#! and ade#uate#! %om"a)e and )an? t'e P01 %and\$dates aga\$nst t'ese %)ste)\$a# g\$3en t'e num(e) of %and\$dates and t'e \$nfo)mat\$on a3a#a(#e.

128. Tu)n\$ng mo)e s"e\$%a##! to t'e tas? t'at t'e Pane# mem(e)s 9e)e as?ed to unde)ta?e# t'e T)(una# notes t'at t'e)e \$s #tt#e gu\$dan%e# \$f an!# \$n t'e P)omot\$ons Po#%# ! a(out t'e ")o%edu)e o) met'odo#og! to (e used to fu#f\$# t'e '\$g'#! %om"#eF eFe)%\$e t'at t'e 4e%ond +ound e3a#uat\$on \$n3o#3es. No adm\$n\$st)at\$3e \$ssuan%e 9as ")o3\$ded e\$t'e). 5nstead# t'e D\*+ ; attem"ted to de3\$se t'e met'odo#og! to (e fo##o9ed.

12<. 5t 'as (een esta(#s'ed t'at on 26 June 2012# t'e D\*+ ; %on3ened t'e Pane# to t'e P)omot\$ons 4ess\$on to (e 'e#d \$n Gene3a f)om 21 Ju#! 2012 to 1 August 2012# fo) %ons\$de)at\$on of a## e#\$g\$(#e %and\$dates fo) ")omot\$on to t'e P02 #e3e# ma#e and fema#e. T'e)e 9e)e 187 fema#e and 212 ma1e e#\$g\$(#e %and\$dates fo) ")omot\$on to t'e P02 #e3e#. T'e Pane# mem(e)s 9e)e# at t'at t\$me# g\$3en a%%ess to a## t'e %and\$dates# fa%t s'eets. 8)om 21 Ju#! to 25 Ju#! 2012# t'e Pane# mem(e)s gat'e)ed \$n Gene3a to %ondu%t t'e\$) \$nd\$3\$dua# assessment of a## t'e %and\$dates# \$n a %ont)o##ed en3\$onment# a9a! f)om an! d\$st)a%t\$on. U"on a))\$3a## t'e Pane# mem(e)s 9e)e ")o3\$ded 9\$' a %om"ute)# a 'a)d %o"! of a## t'e fa%t s'eets# d\$3\$ded (! gende) and g)ade #e3e## and t'e fou) #s\$ts of %and\$dates to use as a tem"#ate fo) t'e\$) )an?\$ng.

150. T'e D\*+ ; ")o3\$ded t'e Pane# mem(e)s 9\$60221( )-378.863(04T(+)-4.4992e)-3.665219(\$).0.8



152. These documents are the genealogy and the other documents for the management of the elements. The documents are not meant to be used as a source of information to the P02 members of the estate of the deceased at the time of the death of the deceased. The Panel members are required to examine the 187 facts and to do the same for the 212 matters and dates to the P02 members. The 90% of the 221 matters as mentioned in the facts.

155. As a result of the A's facts and some of the other facts, the Panel members are required to examine the 187 facts and dates of the deceased and the 212 matters and dates in the facts and under the same task for the 212 matters and dates in the facts and under the same task.

158. The Tribunal's assessment of the evidence presented by the complainant in its request for a review of the Panel's findings on the qualitative assessment of the complainant's performance in the Promotion Process is not a review of the Panel's findings on the qualitative assessment of the complainant's performance in the Promotion Process. The Tribunal's assessment of the evidence presented by the complainant in its request for a review of the Panel's findings on the qualitative assessment of the complainant's performance in the Promotion Process is not a review of the Panel's findings on the qualitative assessment of the complainant's performance in the Promotion Process.



to the 'sg'est. None of the 9stresses "esented (! the +es"ondent %ou#d ")o3\$de  
an! %ogent eF"#anat\$on as to 9'! t'ss met'odo#og! 9as %'osen. The e3\$den%e  
dss%#osed t'at no stat\$st\$a# ad3\$e 9as soug't o) o(ta\$ned \$n )es"e%t of t'e  
a""o")\$ate met'odo#og! to (e used.

162. The T\$(una# )e#a##s t'at t'e ne9 3e)s\$on of t'e P)omot\$ons Po#\$% !& a""#sed  
fo) t'e 2011 P)omot\$ons 4ess\$on& \$s su(stant\$a##! d\$ffe)ent fom t'e ")e3\$ous  
"o#\$% ! as \$t enta\$#s a )an?\$ng ")o%ess )at'e) t'an a s(o)\$ng one. The %onso#\$dat\$on



Case No.

UNDT/GVA/2015/158



e.

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2015/158

Judgment No. UNDT/2016/056





A " "ant. 5f t'e T) (una# 9e) e to g)ant t'e A " "ant a ") omot\$on& \$t 9ou#d (e tantamount to ")e:udg\$ng t'e out%ome of t'e %om"a)at\$3e assessment of a## e#\$g\$(#e %and\$dates en3\$saged \$n t'e P)omot\$ons Po#\$%!& and su(st\$ut\$ng \$ts assessment fo) t'at of t'e Pane# and t'e \*\$g' Comm\$ss\$one)& somet'\$ng t'at t'e T)\$(una# \$s ne\$t'e) a##o9ed no) \$n a "os\$t\$on to do.

185. As to t'e A " "ant@s a#te)nat\$3e )e6uest fo) '\$s %

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2015/158

Judgment No. UNDT/2016/056



1<1. Consde)ng t'e eFt)eme d\$ff\$%u#t\$es \$n as)e)ta\$ng t'e A""#\$%ant@s % 'an%es

9ou#d not automat\$a##! )e%e\$3e )et)oa%t\$3e "a!ment of sa#a)! at t'e '\$g'e) #e3e#  
f)om 20 =%to(e) 2012& e3en \$f ")omoted and& as a )esu#t& )es%\$ss\$on of t'e  
%ontested de%\$s\$on 9ou#d not fu##! %om"ensate a #oss of sa#a)!. T'e T\$(una# must  
t'e)fo)e eFam\$ne \$f t'\$s "oss\$(#e #oss of sa#a)!& \$n %ase t'e +es"ondent does not  
e#e%t to "a! %om"ensat\$on \$n #seu of )es%\$ss\$on& :ust\$fses a9a)d\$ng mate)\$a#

As a result of its judgment, the Dispute Tribunal (under article 10 of the Convention) ordered one

of the following: a/ The respondent's claim for compensation of the alleged administrative damage is dismissed. The respondent's claim for compensation of the alleged moral damage is also dismissed. The respondent's claim for compensation of the alleged material damage is also dismissed. The respondent's claim for compensation of the alleged moral damage is also dismissed. The respondent's claim for compensation of the alleged material damage is also dismissed.

b/ The respondent's claim for compensation of the alleged moral damage is supported by evidence. The respondent's claim for compensation of the alleged material damage is not supported by evidence. The respondent's claim for compensation of the alleged moral damage is supported by evidence. The respondent's claim for compensation of the alleged material damage is not supported by evidence.

201. The respondent's claim for compensation of the alleged moral damage is supported by evidence. The respondent's claim for compensation of the alleged material damage is not supported by evidence. The respondent's claim for compensation of the alleged moral damage is supported by evidence. The respondent's claim for compensation of the alleged material damage is not supported by evidence.

202. The respondent's claim for compensation of the alleged moral damage is supported by evidence. The respondent's claim for compensation of the alleged material damage is not supported by evidence. The respondent's claim for compensation of the alleged moral damage is supported by evidence. The respondent's claim for compensation of the alleged material damage is not supported by evidence.

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2015/158

Judgment No. UNDT/2016/056

206. The Applicant's request for moral damages is based on an alleged fundamental breach of the duty of care. The Tribunal's decision does not need to be supported by evidence based on the facts of the case.

Case No.

UNDT/GVA/2015/158



218. In 39 of the foregoing (DHC5DH4A)

a. The contested decision denying the Applicant a right to the P02  
#3e# s' e(!) esndedG

(. 4'ou#d t' e +es"ondent e#e%t to "a! f\$nan%\$a# %om"ensat\$on \$instead of  
effe%t\$3e#! )es%\$nd\$ng t' e de%\$s\$on& 'e s'a## "a! t' e A" "#\$%ant C \* 86&000G

%. The aforementioned Commission's decision is a result of the Commission's (ea)  
\$ntest at the United States')\$me )ate 9\$' effe%t f)om t' e date t'\$s  
Judgment (e%omes eFe%uta(#e unt\$# "a!ment of sa\$d %om"ensat\$on. An  
add\$ona# f\$3e "e) %ent s'a## (e a" "#\$ed to t' e Un\$ted 4tates ")\$me )ate 60  
da!s f)om t' e date t'\$s Judgment (e%omes eFe%uta(#eG and

d.