Case No.:

UNITED NATIONS DISPUTE TRIBUNAL

6. 3n 7 No0em5e(2012& t!e su\%essfu\# \%and\\$date 8as \\$nfo(med of !e(se\#e\%t\\$on\& and 8as ad0\\$sed t!at !e(t(ansfe(8ou\#d 5e effe\%t\\$0e on 15 Janua(1 201 .

- 7. As a (esu#t of su5seAuent nAu(ses on ad0e(tsed and fs#ed "ost 8st!sn 'T-sn 201 & t!e A""#s%ant 8 as nfo(med on 15 August 2014 as%o(dsng to !sm\ 51 a -enso(@uman 'esou(ses 3ffse(& @uman 'esou(ses 2 anagement -e(0se)).@' 2 -/+& UN3G\ t!att!e #stsgsous "ost !ad 5een fs#ed sn 201 .
- :. T!e A""#\$%ant (eAuested management e0a#uat\$on of t!e \$m"ugned de%\$s\$on on 1= -e"tem5e(2014. T!e 2 anagement ,0a#uat\$on Un\$t). 2 ,U/+ (e"#\$ed 51 #ette(of 1= Janua(1 2015& u" !o#d\$ng t!e de%\$s\$on.
- =. T!e "(esent a""#\$%at\$on 8 as f\$#ed on 2 Janua(1 2015. T!e 'es"ondent (e"#\$ed on 2 2 a(%! 2015& anne;\$ng a num5e(of do%uments (e%o(d\$ng t!e "(o%ess #ead\$ng to t!e %ontested de%\$s\$on.
- 10. Pu(suant to 3 (de(s Nos. 122)GVA/2015+ of 1: June 2015& 176)GVA/2015+ of 21 -e"tem5e(2015 and 20=)GVA/2015+ of 22 3%to5e(2015& t!\\$s %ase& toget!e(8\\$t! a num5e(of ot!e(%ases f\\$#ed 51 t!e A""#\\$%ant\& 8 as (efe((ed to med\\$at\\$on\& and t!e "(o\\$eed\\$ngs 5efo(e t!e T(\\$5una#8e(e sus"ended fo(t!at "u("ose. @o 8e0e(\& med\\$at\\$on effo(ts 8e(e unsu\\$essfu#\ and t!e "(o\\$eed\\$ngs 5efo(e t!e T(\\$5una#6e)) (esumed on 2 No0em5e(2015)).
- 11. <1 3 (de(No. :4)GVA/2016+ of 2= A"(\$# 2016½ t!e "a(t\\$es 8 e(e \\$n0\\$ted to f\\$#e %omments\\$ \\$f an1\\$ 8\\$t! (es"e\\$t to t!e T(\\$5una\\$>s 0\\$e 8 t!at a Cudgment \\$ou\\$d 5e (ende(ed 8\\$t!out !o\\$d\\$ng a !ea(\\$ng. T!e "a(t\\$es made no \\$omments.

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2015/074

Judgment No. UNDT/2016/070

- \$\$. T!e (e#ated (eAuest fo(management e0a#uat\$on 8 as not su5m\$tted 8\$t!\$n t!e "(es%(\$5ed t\$me #\$m\$ts. A#t!oug! t!e A""#\$%ant !o#ds t!at !e #ea(ned a5out t!e d\$s"uted t(ansfe(\$n August/-e"tem5e(2014&!e !ad 5een \$nfo(med a#(ead1 \$n Ee5(ua(1 2014 51 @ ' 2 -& UN3 G& t!at .6d7u(\$ng 201 on#1 one P* "os\$t\$on \$n 6 ' T 7 8 as f\$##ed as a (esu#t of #ate(a# (eass\$gnment 8\$t!\$n de"a(tment/. G!\$#e t!e A""#\$%ant f\$#ed ot!e(a""#\$%at\$ons a(\$s\$ng f(om t!e same %o((es"onden%e on#1 \$n Ju#1 2014&!e (eAuested management e0a#uat\$on of t!e matte(at !and \$n -e"tem5e(2014&\$.e.& nea(#1 se0en mont!s afte(t!e Ee5(ua(1 2014 %ommun\$%at\$on. T!e A""#\$%ant !as engaged \$n a %ons\$stent "atte(n of 5e!a0\$ou(of \$#a\$m\$ng t!at !e 8 as una 8 a(e of t!e out%ome of "ost\$ng de%\$s\$ons& 8 !en \$n faxt !e 8 as \$\frac{1}{2}\$ as \$\frac{1}{2}\$ on \$\frac{1}{2}\$ on \$\frac{1}{2}\$ on \$\frac{1}{2}\$ on \$\frac{1}{2}\$ on \$\frac{1}{2}\$ of \$\frac{1}{2}\$ on \$\f
- 5. 3 n t!e me(\$ts& unde(se%. .2)#+ of -T/A9/2010/ & #ate(a# t(ansfe(s a(e e;em"t f(om t!e staff se#e%t\$on s1stem& \$n\\$#ud\$ng t!e %ondu%t of .e0a#uat\$on a\\$0\$t\$es/ su%! as a 8 (\$tten assessment and a %om"eten%1*5ased \$nte(0\$e 8B)
- %. 2 o(eo0e(& se%. .2)e+ of t!e same \$nst(u%t\$on e;%#udes f(om \$ts s%o"e of a""#\$%at\$on&t!e .6m7o0ement du(\$ng t!e f\$(st f\$0e lea(s of se(0\$%e of staff se(0\$ng aga\$nst a P*2 o(P* #anguage "os\$t\$on 8 !o a(e su50e%t to t!e "(o0\$s\$ons of t!e adm\$n\$st(at\$0e \$nst(u%t\$on sett\$ng out s"e%\$a# %ond\$t\$ons fo((e%(u\$tment o("#a\$ement of %and\$dates su%essfu# \$n a %om"et\$t\$0e e;am\$nat\$on fo("os\$t\$0s (eAu\$0g s"e\$a# #anguage s4\$##s/. 9n t!\$s %onne%t\$on\$0s se%. 2.2 of Adm\$n\$st(at\$0e 9nst(u\$t\$0n -T/A9/2000/1)-"e\$3a# %ond\$t\$0ns fo((e%(u\$tment of "#a\$ement of %and\$dates su%essfu# \$n a %om"et\$t\$0e e;am\$nat\$0n fo("osts (eAu\$0g s"e\$a# #anguage s4\$##s+"(o0\$0s t!at du(\$ng t!e\$0f (\$0s lea(s of se(0\$0%e\$0s #anguage %and\$0dates su%essfu# \$n a %om"et\$t\$0e #anguage e;am\$nat\$0n .ma1 5e (eass\$9ned to #anguage "osts at ot!e(dut1 stat\$0ns a%o(d\$ng to t!e needs of t!e 3 (gan\$Fat\$0n/. Eu(t!e(mo(e\$0 "a(a. 1=.4 of t!e 9ns"\$

#ate(a##1 #anguage staff& \$n\%#ud\\$ng H t(ans\#ato(s ... u" to H t!e P*5 \#e0e\#\ 8!o se(0e \\$n Ne 8 ?o(4\k Gene0a\k V\\$enna and Na\\$(o5\\$/B

- d. T!e %(\$t\$%\$sed t(ansfe(8as \$n a\%o(dan\%e 8\\$t! t!e a5o0e\%\\$ted "(o0\\$s\\$ons. 9t fe\## outs\\$de t!e a""\#\$\%at\\$on of t!e staff se\#e\t\\$on s1stem\& and no o5\#\\$gat\\$on e;\\$sted to engage \\$n standa(d assessment a\%t\\$0\\$t\\$es su\%! as 8(\\$ten tests and \%om"\eten\%1*5ased \\$nte(0\\$e8s. -taff (egu\#at\\$ons 1.2)\%+ and 4.2 \%ate(s fo(\#ate(a\# t(ansfe(s and \%annot 5e sa\\$d to \%ont(ad\\$\%t t!e need to se\%u(e t!e !\\$g!\est standa(ds of eff\\$\%\en\%1\&\%om"\eten\%e and \\$nteg(\\$t1\B)
- e. T!e(e 8as no o5#\$gat\$on to %ondu%t a 8(\$tten assessment o(a %om"eten%1*5ased \$nte(0\$e 8 fo(a #ate(a# t(ansfe(. T!e on#1 assessment %a((\$ed out 8as a %om"a(at\$0e ana#1s\$s of t!e %and\$dates& 5ased on t!e\$(Pe(sonne# @\$sto(1 P(of\$#e).P@P/+& 8\$t! a 0\$e 8 to 0e(\$f1\$ng e#\$g\$5\$#\$t1 and %om"#\$an%e 8\$t! m\$n\$mum (eAu\$(ements and %om"eten%\$es. T!\$s (e0\$e 8 \$n%#uded t!e A""#\$%ant>s P@PB
- f. T!e A""#\$%ant !as not "(o0en& as "e(t!e (eAu\$(ed standa(d& t!at t!e de%\$s\$on 8 as ta\$nted 51 \$##*mot\$0at\$on o(e;t(aneous fa%to(s. 9ts out%ome 8 as not man\$fest#1 un(easona5#e& g\$0en t!at t!e t(ansfe((ed staff mem5e(meets a## t!e (eAu\$(ements fo(t!e P* "ost \$n Auest\$on. A#so&!a0\$ng Co\$ned t!e 3(gan\$Fat\$on \$n 2010& s!e 8 as 8\$t!\$n !e(f\$st f\$0e 1ea(s of se(0\$%e& 8 !e(e51 fa##\$ng unde(se%. 2.2 of -T/A9/2000/1& se%. .2)e+ of -T/A9/2010/ and "a(a. 1=.4 of t!e 2 anua#. Iast#1& g\$0en t!at 'T-&UN3G&!ad an o0e(a## (e"(esentat\$on of 8 omen of 1 J and on#1 : J \$n P(ofess\$ona# "os\$t\$ons& t!e t(ansfe(of a fema#e %and\$date %ont(\$5uted to "(omote gende(5a#an%eB and
- g. T!e A""#\$%ant !as not d\$s%!a(ged t!e 5u(den of "(oof \$n%um5ent on !\$m (ega(d\$ng !\$s a##egat\$on of 5\$as and (et(\$5ut\$on aga\$nst !\$m& as 8e## as 8\$t! (es"e%t to !\$s 5(oad a##egat\$ons on ot!e(se#e%t\$on o(t(ansfe(de%\$s\$ons. @\$s %#a\$ms on gende(d\$s%(\$m\$nat\$on a(e 5e#\$ed 51 t!e stat\$st\$%s on 8 omen (e"(esentat\$on.

Receivabiliy

<u>C!a##enge of a (e0\se 8 a5#e adm\n\st(at\se de\s\s\on</u>

14. 'ega(d\$ng t!e 'es"ondent>s %#a\$m t!at t!e de%\$s\$on at sta4e does not !a0e d\$(e%t #ega# %onseAuen%es on t!e A""#\$%ant>s te(ms of a""o\$ntment&t!e T(\$5una# \$s sat\$sf\$ed t!at t!e A""#\$%ant does \$dent\$f1 and %ontest an \$nd\$0\$dua# adm\$n\$st(at\$0e de%\$s\$on&to 8\$t&t!e %!o\$%e of f\$##\$ng 51 #ate(a# t(ansfe(a 0a%an%1 fo(8 !\$%! !e !ad a""#\$ed. As a#(ead1 (u#ed \$n Krioutchkov UNDT/2016/051& t!\$s %ou(se of a%t\$on 51 t!e Adm\$n\$st(at\$on %a((\$es o50e%t\$0e (e"e(%uss\$ons on t!e %!an%es of a g\$0en

%and\$date to 5e %ons\$de(ed fo(Kt!us to "oss\$5#1 5e a""o\$nted aga\$nstKt!e %on%e(ned "ost\ and t!e %ond\tsons unde(8!\structure !e o(s!e ma1 %om"ete fo(\structure t).

15. -"e%f%a##1& a t(ansfe("u(suant to se%. 2.5 of -T/A9/2010/ \$m"#\$es t!at on#1 staff a#(ead1 !o#d\$ng t!e same g(ade and se(0)\$

Page: of 1

Merits

22.

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2015/074

Judgment No. UNDT/2016/070

0. 9t s = 8e em*esta5#\$s!ed t!at t!e 5u(den of "(o0\$ng an1 a##egat\$ons of \$##*mot\$0at\$on o(e;t(aneous fa%to(s (ests 8 \$t! t!e a""#\$%ant) ennin!'s 2011*UNAT*1:4& "bdei#n

. 9n 0\$e 8 of t!e fo(ego\$ng\$ t!e T(\$5una# D , C9D , -D

T!e a""#\$%at\$on \$s (ece%ted \$n \$ts ent\$(et1.

)Si!ned+

Judge T!omas Ia4e(

Dated t!\s : t! da1 of June 2016

, nte(ed $n\ t!e 'eg\$ te(on $t!\$: $^{t!}\$ da1 of June 2016)Si !ned+

'enL 2. Va(gas 2.& 'eg\$st(a(&Gene0a