
UNITED NATIONS DISPUTE TRIBUNAL

Case No.: UNDT/GVA/2015/10

Request No.: UNDT/2015/001

Date: 12 July 2015

Original: English

1. The Applicant contests the decision not to extend the term of the assignment to the position of Legal Counsellor of the Department of United Nations Operations, as the United Nations General Assembly (UNGA) (UN) /UNG.C23.

2. The request is based on the fact that the proposed decision is set aside.

5. The Applicant has submitted a copy of a letter dated 7 June 2015 to the United Nations Secretary-General (UNSG) on a matter of assignment.

The letter of 7 June 2015 states that the term of the assignment to the position of Legal Counsellor of the Department of United Nations Operations should be extended to the end of 2015. The Applicant has also submitted a copy of the letter of 7 June 2015 to the United Nations Secretary-General (UNSG) on a matter of assignment.

5. On 8 June 2015, the Applicant's term of assignment to the position of Legal Counsellor of the Department of United Nations Operations was extended until 30 June 2015, and so was the Applicant's term of assignment to the position of Legal Counsellor of the Department of United Nations Operations (UN) /UNG.C. The Applicant's term of assignment to the position of Legal Counsellor of the Department of United Nations Operations was extended until the end of 2015.

6. The Applicant has submitted a copy of a letter dated 11 June 2015 to the United Nations Secretary-General (UNSG) on a matter of assignment. The Applicant has also submitted a copy of the letter of 11 June 2015 to the United Nations Secretary-General (UNSG) on a matter of assignment. The Applicant has also submitted a copy of the letter of 11 June 2015 to the United Nations Secretary-General (UNSG) on a matter of assignment.

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2015/160

Judgment No. UNDT/2017/008

d. On the basis of the number of provisions stated above, it is prima facie clear that the assignment is not based on nefarious or other reasons sufficient to render it void. To the

\$. The assignment is not void (assignment to Ne7 <0' = !ad -een extended until 31 December 2015)

\$. The (one) party is not a party to the assignment. The party is not a party to the assignment. The party is not a party to the assignment.

\$. The assignment is not void as to the funding of the party is not void.

\$. As the assignment is not void as to the funding of the party is not void.

/. As the assignment is not void as to the funding of the party is not void.

e. The assignment is not void as to the funding of the party is not void.

f. No assignment is void as to the funding of the party is not void.

of the 'ent f\$nan%\$a# 'e'\$od+ and the "ost L s!ou#d 'etu'n to \$ts o'\$g\$na#
off%e -(t!en2G

e. The %ontested de%\$\$son 7as Bustf\$ed -(the o"e'at\$ona# %'\$%umstar%es
7\$t!\$n UN) ,/UNG.C. The "ost at sta=e 7as used afte' de%\$d\$ng to !a/e an
UmoBa .\$te Coo'd\$nat'o' to su""o't the '%t\$%a# UmoBa de"#o(ment. H\$t!out
t!\$s measu'e+ UN) ,/UNG.C>s 'ead\$ness to meet the UmoBa 1 No/em-e'
2015 de"#o(ment dead#\$ne 7ou#d !a/e -een %om"om\$\$sed+ "otent\$a##(
Beo"a'd\$\$ng the ent\$'e C#uste' : de"#o(ment. 9n !\$s memo'andum dated
: June 2015+ the .e%'eta'(6Gene'a# d\$'e%ted a## Deads of 8 \$\$sson to
ded\$ate a""'o""\$ate #e/e# of 'esou'%es to UmoBa de"#o(ment 'ead\$ness. T!\$s
d\$'e%t\$on 7as 'e\$te'ated -(the Ass\$stant .e%'eta'(6Gene'a# fo' E\$e#d .u""o't
-(ema\$# of 8 June 2015. The UmoBa .\$te Coo'd\$nat'o' tem"o'a'("ost 7as
f\$##ed as of 1 .e"tem-e' 2015G

f. The A""#\$%ant 7'ong#(a'gues t!at the -u'den \$s on the
Adm\$n\$st'at\$on to ""o/e t!at the 'efusa# to e&tend !e' tem"o'a'(ass\$gnment
7as mot\$/ated -(an \$m""o"e' 'eason. 9nstead+ the -u'den 'ests 7\$t! the
A""#\$%ant to addu%e e/\$den%e t!at the de%\$\$son 7as \$m""o"e'#(mot\$/ated o'
ot!e' 7\$se a" '\$%ous. . !e !as fa\$#ed to ""offe' an(su%! e/\$den%eG and

g. The A""#\$%ant !as a#ead(-een "ad %om"ensat\$on \$n the amount of
U.D5+000 as 8 ;U %on%#uded t!at UN) ,/UNG.C !ad not ade4uate#(
su-stant\$ated t!at the A""#\$%ant !ad -een affo'ded ""o"e' due ""o%ess.

18. The T'\$-una# 7\$## f\$'st add'ess the g'ounds fo' %!a##enge "e'ta\$n\$ng to
fo'ma# as'e%ts of the \$m"ugned de%\$\$son+ \$e.+ matte's of aut!o't(and the natu'e
of the A""#\$%ant's adm\$n\$st'at\$/e #n= to the #t\$g\$ous "ost. 9t 7\$## #ate' tu'n to
su-stant\$/e as'e%ts+ nota-#(t!ose %on%e'n\$ng the 'easons -e!nd the \$m"ugned
de%\$\$son+ t!at \$s+ the fa\$#u'e to s!a'e 7\$t! the A""#\$%ant the 'easons fo' the end of
!e' 'eass\$gnment and the ""o" '\$et(of the mot\$/es t!e'eto.

The Applicant's administrative link to the Legal Officer's post

1 . Pu'suant to staff 'egu#at\$on 1.20%3F

. taff mem-e's a'e su-Be%t to t!e aut!o'\$t(of t!e .e%'eta'(6Gene'a#
and to ass\$gnment -(!\$m o' !e' to an(of t!e a%t\$/

25. The Applicant thus had no entitlement to a refund of the

2 . H!\$#st t!e t\$t#e of t!e . *P e&"#\$%\$t#(a##udes to 1UN Pea%e * "e'at\$ons2+ no
defn\$st\$on of t!\$s te'm \$s "'o/\$ded. 9t \$s not\$%ea-#e+ ne/e't!e#ess+ t!at \$ts te&t
'e"eated#('efe's to 1m\$ss\$ons2 as \$ts o-Be%t/add'essee. T!e T'\$-una# ana#(sed at
#engt! t!e not\$on of 1m\$ss\$on2 \$n elpignano UNDT/2015/075 and+ 7!\$#e
o-se'/\$ng a 'eg'etta-#e #a%= of %a'\$t(\$n defn\$ng t!\$s %on%e"t+ \$t %on%#uded t!at
UN) , 7as not to -e %ons\$de'ed as su%! . Ae#e/ant#(+ t!e Aes"ondent !\$mse#f
%a\$ms t!at It!e UN) , \$s su""o'ted+ admn\$ste'ed an

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2015/160

Judgment No. UNDT/2017/008

Propriety of the motives alleged

6. The Tribunal notes that the Applicant does not bring sufficient allegations of "abuse of power" or of "undue influence". The fact that the decision must have been based on "objective" grounds because there are no objective elements as a result of the "cost-benefit" analysis to "manage" the UN, UNGA and argues that as a result of the failure to "provide" the reasons and the decision, the burden to demonstrate that it was not motivated shifts to the Administration.

7. In this respect, the applicant failed to demonstrate

"'oof s!\$fts to ?!at staff mem-e'@ 7!o must s!o7 t!'oug! %hea' and %on/\$n%\$ng e/\$den%e t!at ?!e/s!e@ 7as den\$ed a fa\$' %!an%e of "'omot\$on.

50. 9n t!\$s %onte&t+ \$t \$s a""'o"\$ate fo' t!e T'\$-una# to e&am\$ne t!e 'easons a#e\$ged -(t!e Aes"ondent+ -ea'\$ng \$n m\$nd t!e "'\$n%"#e t!at 7!en a Bust\$fs%at\$on \$s g\$/en -(t!e Adm\$n\$st'at\$on fo' t!e e&e'%\$se of \$ts d\$s%'et\$on \$t must -e su""'o'ted -(t!e fa%ts 0+slam 20116UNAT61153.

51. Con%'ete#(+ \$n t!e "'esent %ase t7o d\$ffe'ent Bust\$fs%at\$ons !a/e -een "ut fo'7a'd t!'oug!out t!e d\$ffe'ent #st\$gat\$on " !ases+ name#(F

a. T!e need to tem"o'a'\$#(!\$'e a ded\$ated "e'son to 7o'= on t!e de"#o(ment of UmoBa -(1 No/em-e' 2015 \$n UN) ,/UNG.C 0UmoBa .\$te Coo'd\$nat'o'3G and

-. .ome "e'fo'man%e s!o't%om\$ngs -(t!e A""#\$%ant+ nota-#(\$n te'ms of %onsu#tat\$on and %oo"e'at\$on 7\$t! %o##eagues.

52. T!e T'\$-una# 7\$## %ons\$de' ea%! of t!em se"a'ate#(.

Need to se%u'e an UmoBa . \$te Coo'd\$nat'o'

55. UmoBa un%ontesta-#(7ent #\$/e .e%'eta'\$at67\$de fo' t!e staff at #a'ge \$n No/em-e' 2015+ and \$t \$s 7e##6=no7n t!at \$ts de"#o(ment 'e4u\$'ed s\$gn\$fs%ant "'e"a'at\$on and !ad eno'mous 'e'e'%uss\$ons on t!e *'gan\$Iat\$on>s fun%t\$on\$ng.)\$=e7\$se+ \$t \$s on 'e'o'd t!at t!e .e%'eta'(6Gene'a# !ad s"e\$fs%a##(u'ged t!e *'gan\$Iat\$on>s management to ta=e a""'o"\$ate measu'es and a##o%ate ade4uate 'esou'%es to ena-#e UmoBa to -e su%%essfu##(de"#o(ed+ an \$nst'u't\$on t!at 7as #ate' 'e#a(ed and 'e\$te'ated -(t!e Ass\$stant .e%'eta'(6Gene'a# fo' E\$e#d .u""'o't.

5:. 9n add\$ton+ t!e Aes"ondent su-m\$tted mate'\$a# \$nds%at\$ng t!at an UmoBa . \$te Coo'd\$nat'o' 7as \$ndeed 'e'u\$ted s!o't#(afte' t!e d\$s%ont\$nuat\$on of t!e A""#\$%ant>s tem"o'a'('eass\$gnment. A#t!oug! !e se'/ed fo' a fe7 mont!s on#(+ t!e s!o't du'at\$on of t!\$s a'angement seems %o!e'ent 7\$t! t!e %\$'%umstan%es of t!e %ase+ s\$ne t!e de"#o(ment of UmoBa to t!e staff at #a'ge 7as+ -(\$ts /e'(natu'e+ a "un%tua# e&e'%\$se. Cons\$tent#(+ t!e o(d 8 892(a)-3.66523(a)-14.3239(t)0C)-4.49925(o)-0.9

Coo'd\$nat0' 7as "'esented f'om t!e outset as a t'ans\$to' (measu'e C nota-#(+ t!e
"os\$t\$on 7as ad/e't\$sed t!'oug! tem"o'a' (/a%an% (announ%ements C and \$t
\$ndeed #asted "'e%\$se# (f'om t7o mont!s \$mmed\$ate# ("'e%ed\$ng t!e Umo!a

'eass\$gnment of a staff mem-e'+ t!e Adm\$nst'at\$on !as to 1''o/\$de a "e'fo'man%e6'e#ated Bust\$f\$%at\$on fo' \$ts de%%\$son2 and+ \$n 'ea%!\$ng \$t+ t!e Adm\$nst'at\$on must 'es"e%t t!e 1'u#e of #a7 and standa'ds of due "'o%ess \$n de%%\$son6ma=\$ng2. Eu't!e'+ 8 ;U o-se'/ed t!at t!e A""#%ant>s "e'fo'man%e a""'a\$sa# fo' 201:62015 !ad not -een %om"#eted at t!e t\$me t!e \$m"ugned de%%\$son 7as made and e/en \$m"#emented. Eu't!e'mo'e+ no 'e%o'd e&\$sts s!o7\$ng t!at s!e !ad -een "'e/\$ous#(not\$f\$ed of t!e %on%e'ns 7\$t! !e' "e'fo'man%e and offe'ed an o""o'tun\$t(to 'es"ond to t!em o' to 'e%t\$f(!e' s!o't%om\$ngs -efo'e end\$ng !e' 'eass\$gnment.

5 . 9n t!\$s /\$e7+ 8 ;U %on%#uded t!at t!e Adm\$nst'at\$on !ad not 1ade4uate#(

14.3239(\$).0. 8 73046(n) - 05-801(qed. t997 9(t) - A" 467an(e) !ad. 40en (e'p/3dec57(t) lde 28 8 () -325.571(2) -020927 8 (e) -14.32

* 'gan\$Iat\$on and 7as assigned -a%= to !e' o'\$g\$na# dut\$es+ 7 !\$% ! 7e'e a ""'o" 'sate fo' !e' \$n te'ms of -a%=g'ound and g'ade. Eo' t!\$s+ \$t \$s not 7a''anted to a7a'd !e' a !\$g!e' %om"ensat\$on.

62. 9n %on%#us\$on+ !a/\$ng s%'ut\$ns\$ed t!e t7o "u""o'ted Bust\$fs\$at\$ons fo' t!e non6e&tens\$on of t!e A""#\$%ant>s 'eass\$gnment C\$.e.+ 'e'fo'man%e s!o't%om\$ngs and use of t!e "ost fo' t!e dut\$es of Umoba .ste Coo'd\$nat'o' C't!e T'\$-una# fnds t!at a#t!oug! one 0"e'fo'man%e3 7as not "'o"e'#(do%umented+ t!\$s s!o't%om\$ng 7as a#ead(a%=no7#edged and ade4uate#('ed'essed. As to t!e se%ond one 0'e"u""os\$ng3+ t!e'e \$s not!\$ng to \$nd\$ate t!at \$t \$s man\$fest#(un'easona-#e o' a'-\$t'a'(+ o' e#se -e#\$ed - (t!e fa%ts.

65. 9n t!\$s #sg!t+ t!e T'\$-una# \$s sat\$sf\$ed t!at t!e *'gan\$Iat\$on !as m\$n\$ma##(s!o7n t!at t!e %ontested de%ss\$on 7as not \$m""o"e'#(mot\$/ated. A%%o'd\$ng#(+ t!e onus fe## on t!e A""#\$%ant to demonst'ate ot!e'7\$se. Do7e/e'+ t!e A""#\$%ant !as not addu%ed an(tang\$-#e e/\$den%e+ #et a#one %#ea' and %on/\$n%\$ng one+ t!at t!e end of !e' 'eass\$gnment 7as due to e&t'aneous fa%to's. T!e fa%t t!at t!e "ost 7as funded and \$ts \$n%um-ent 'ema\$ned assigned to Ne7 <o' = unt\$# t!e end of 2015 does not suff\$%e to ma=e an \$nfe'en%e t!at t!e de%ss\$on 7as %a""\$%ous o' \$##6mot\$/ated.

6.: T!\$s T'\$-una# \$s t!us una-#e to fnd t!at t!e \$m"ugned de%ss\$on 7as ta\$nted - (\$m""o"e' mot\$/es.

65. Eo' a## t!e a-o/e+ t!e T'\$-una# fnds t!atF

a. T!e A""#\$%ant's due "'o%ess '\$g!ts %on%e'n\$ng !e' "u""o'ted "e'fo'man%e s!o't%om\$ngs 7e'e /\$o#ated+ -ut t!\$s -'ea%! 7as dete%ted and 'ed'essed - (t!e 8 ;UG and

-. T!e Adm\$n\$st'at\$on d\$d not 'es"%t \$ts dut(to "'o/\$de t!e affe%ted staff mem-e' 7\$t! t!e 'easons -e!\$nd t!e \$m"ugned de%ss\$on+ a#t!oug! \$t #ate' m\$st\$gated \$ts 'es"ons\$-#\$t(\$n t!\$s 'es"%t - (dss%os\$ng su%! 'easons at t!e management e/a#uat\$on stage. Not7\$t!stand\$ng t!e \$n\$t\$a# -'ea%! of t!e

ne\$t!e' 7a''anted to 'es%\$nd t!e de%\$\$son no' to a7a'd add\$t\$ona#
%om"ensat\$on to t!e A ""#\$%ant on t!\$s a%%ount.

66. 9n /\$e7 of t!e fo'ego\$ng; t!e T'\$-una# D; C9D; .F

T!e a""#\$%at\$on \$s d\$sm\$\$ssed.

0Signed3

Judge Te'esa , 'a/o

Dated t!\$s 6