"#\$g%e&' No.: UNITED NATIONS DISPUTE TRIBUNAL

Case No.: UNDT/GVA/2016/0 !

Da'e:

UNDT/2017/01(7) a*+, 2017

O*-g-&a.:

E&g.-s,

"#\$ge Te*esa B*a/o Before:

Registry: Ge&e/a

Registrar: Re&0) . Va*gas

10

/.

SECRETAR 23GENERAL O4 T1E UNITED NATIONS

JUDGMENT

Counsel for Applicant:

Se.f3*e5*ese&'e\$

Introduction

1. !" an #n\$om%lete a%%l#\$at#on #led on ' (\$to)e* 2016+ \$om%leted on

9. (n 8 Ju&" 201:+ s,e 6*ote anot,e* ema#\ to 8 9+ UN5CCC+ *e@uest#ng inter alia #n o*mat#on a)out 6,et,e*,e* *e%at*#at#on g*ant,ad)een *em#tted and+ # so+

d95 - 3.66653(n) - (n) - 0.9602210.873566(d)d -

- 1:. ! " ema#\(\alpha\) dated 30 a" 2016 to t,e anagement A2a\(\alpha\) uat#on Un#t .3 AU40+t,e A\(\delta\) \(\delta\) #\$ant *e@uested management e2a\(\delta\) uat#on o 3t,e \(\delta\) ong o2e*due \(\delta\) a"ment Bo, e*C *e\(\delta\) *#at#on g*ant4.
- 16. 50&&6#ng &ea*an\$e *om UN5CCC+ t,e 5#nan\$#a& 9esou*\$es anagement 1e*2#\$e+ UN (G+ *e&eased t,e %a"ment o t,e *e%at*#at#on g*ant 6#t, a %a"ment date o 31 a" 2016. As %e* t,e do\$uments on #&e+ t,e *e%at*#at#on g*ant amount ,e&d #n t*ust 6as U1D:+99'.07. >t 6as 6#*ed+ as %e* t,e A%%&#\$ant?s #nst*u\$t#ons+ to ,e* ; 9 a\$\$ount+ and t,e \$on2e*s#on *om U1D to ; 9 6as made us#ng t,e %*e2a#&#ng Un#ted Nat#ons (%e*at#ona& 9ates o A=\$,ange .UN (9A0 o a" 2016+ name&" U1D1 E ; 93.897+ *esu&t#ng #n t,e \$*ed#t#ng o ; 923+3:8.89 to t,e A%%&#\$ant.
- 17. !" &ette* dated 6 June 2016+ t,e AU a\$7no6&edged *e\$e#%t o t,e A%%&#\$ant?s *e@uest o* management e2a&uat#on.
- 18. !" ema#& o 8 June 2016+ a 8 uman 9 esou*\$es (#\$e*+ 8 9+ UN5CCC+ sent to t,e A%&#\$ant an 3U (JA \$&#% *ega*d#ng t,e d#s)u*sement o t,e *e%at*#at#on g*ant4. >t s,o6ed t,at U1D:+99'.07 ,ad)een \$&ea*ed o* %a"ment e e\$t#2e 31 a" 2016. !" ema#& o t,e same da"+ t,e A%&#\$ant #n o*med UN5CCC t,at t,e mone" ,ad not "et *ea\$,ed ,e* a\$\$ount and t,at+)ased on t,e #n o*mat#on s,e ,ad *e\$e#2ed+ s,e 6as o t,e 2#e6 t,at t,e (*gan#<at*#on ,ad unde*%a#d ,e* U1D268.29.
- 19. ! "ema#& o 9 June 2016+ a 8 uman 9 esou*\$es Ass#stant+ 8 9+ UN5CCC+ *e%&#ed to t,e A%%&#\$ant t,at s,e ,ad 3\$onta\$ted t*easu*" aga#n o* u*t,e* #n o*mat#on4.
- 20. ! " ema#k o 10 June 2016+ t,e A%%&#\$ant *e#te*ated t,at s,e ,ad not *e\$e#2ed an" mon#es #n ,e* a\$\$ount. (n t,e same da"+ a 8 uman 9 esou*\$es Ass#stant+ UN5CCC+ *e%&#ed to t,e A%%&#\$ant t,at UN5CC 6 as 3st#&k a 6 a#t#ng eed)a\$7 *om t*easu*"4.
- 21. ! " ema#& o 1' June 2016 to t,e A%%&#\$ant+ t,e AU ad2#sed ,e* t,at 3t,e Adm#n#st*at#on %*esented a %a"s&#% 6,e*e)" t,e *e%at*#at#on g*ant B,ad)eenC

t*ans e**ed to B, e*C a\$\$ount4+ and as7ed ,e* to \$on #*m # s,e ,ad *e\$e#2ed t,e %a"ment #n @uest#on. ! " ema#& o 1: June 2016+ t,e A%%&#\$ant inter alia ad2#sed t,e - AU t,at a&t,oug, s,e ,ad not *e\$e#2ed an" %a"s&#%+ s,e ,ad)een unde*%a#d U1D268 o* ,e* *e%at*#at#on g*ant and t,at s,e 6#s,ed to 3add t,#s unde*%a"ment to B, e*C \$&a#m aga#nst UN5CCC4.

- 22. ! " ema#& dated 21 June 2016+ a 8 uman 9 esou*\$es (#\$e*+ 8 9+ UN5CCC+ #n@u#*ed 6#t, t,e A%%&#\$ant # s,e ,ad *e\$e#2ed t,e *e%at*#at#on g*ant.
- 23. !" &ette* dated 1' Ju&" 2016+ t,e AU #n o*med t,e A%%&#\$ant t,at #t 6 ou&d %*o\$eed to \$&ose ,e* #&e. >n su%%o*t o t,#s+ t,e AU ad2#sed t,e A%%&#\$ant+ inter alia+ t,at %a"ment o ,e* *e%at*#at#on g*ant+ amount#ng to U1D:+99'.07+ ,ad)een e=e\$uted on 31 a" 2016 and t,at s,e ,ad \$on #*med *e\$e#%t o t,e e@u#2a&ent

A%%&#\$ant+ #.e.+ 21 da"s+ \$an on&" &ead to \$on\$&ude t,at t,e %a"ment 6as made #n June 2016 and t,at+ t,us+ t,e .,#g,e*0 UN (9A *ate o* t,at mont, s,ou&d ,a2e)een a%%&#edH

- \$. 1,e &ost t,e o%%o*tun#t" to 3add to B,e*C u^*ent ", e&d *#s7 *ee #n2estment a\$\$ount 6#t, a "#e&d o a%%*o=#mate&" 6.: I %e* annum4H
- d. > %a"ment ,ad)een made #n De\$em)e* 201:+ s,e 6ou&d ,a2e)ene #tted *om a ,#g,e* UN (9A .U1D1 E ; 9 '+290&H

e.

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2016/089

Judgment No. UNDT/2017/013

T,e A%%&#\$ant #s a&so not ent#t&ed to mo*a& damages)e\$ause s,e d#d not su)m#t an" e2#den\$e #n su%%o*t o #t+ as *e@u#*ed)" a*t. 10.:.)0 o t,e UNDT 1tatute. 5u*t,e*mo*e+ 3a de&a" \$annot)e \$ons#de*ed as a undamenta&)*ea\$, o t,e A%%&#\$ant?s *#g,ts4+ and s,e d#d not 3\$&a#m to)e #n #nan\$#a& d#st*ess L o* to ,a2e su e*ed s%e\$# #\$ mo*a& damages due to t,e de&a"4.

Consideration

27. T,e T*#) una& #*st ,as to de\$#de u%on some %*e&#m#na*" %*o\$edu*a& matte*s.

Ex parte documents filed by the Applicant

28. T,e T*#)unal de\$#des t,at t,e ex parte do\$uments #led)" t,e A\%less less ant on 17 5e)*ua*" 2017 s,all *ema#n ex parte

Legal framework

32. 1ta *ule 3.19.a0 .9e%at*#at#on g*ant0 %*o2#des t, atF

T,e %u*%ose o t,e *e%at*#at#on g*ant %*o2#ded)" sta *egu&at#on 9.' #s to a\$#&#tate t,e *e&o\$at#on o e=%at*#ate sta mem)e*s to a \$ount*" ot,e* t,an t,e \$ount*" o t,e &ast dut" stat#on+ %*o2#ded t,at t,e" meet t,e \$ond#t#ons \$onta#ned #n anne= >V to t,e 1ta 9egu&at#ons and #n t,#s *u&e.

33. 1ta 9egulat#on 9. 'st#%ulates t,atF

T,e 1e $^*eta^*''/Gene^*a\&$ s,a&& esta)&#s, a s\$,eme o* t,e %a"ment o *e%at*#at#on g*ants #n a\$\$o*dan\$e 6#t, t,e ma=#mum *ates and unde* t,e \$ond#t#ons s%e\$# #ed #n anne= >V o t,ese 9egu&at#ons.

3'. T,ea)o2e/ment#oned anne=>V.9e%at*#at#on g*ant0 states t,e oldo 6#ngF

>n %*#n\$#%&e+ t,e *e%at*#at#on g*ant s,a&\)e %a"a)&e to sta mem)e*s 6,o ,a2e \$om%&eted at &east #2e "ea*s o @ua&# "#ng

su) m#tted, e* %*oo o *e&o\$at#on to t, e date o 3%

Com%ensat#on o* mate*#a& damages

\$annot)e \$onst*ued as alleng 6#t, #n t, e *es%ons#)#left" o t, e Un#ted Nat#ons+ and \$annot #m%a\$t on t, e a%%left UN (9A. 5u*t, e*mo*e+ an" damage o t, e A%%left at t, as to)e assessed)" \$om%a*#ng t, e amount o - ; 9 s, e 6ould , a2e *e\$e#2ed #n \$ase o 3t#meleft %a"ment4 as des\$*#)ed a)o2e+ as o%%osed to t, e amount a\$tualleft "*e\$e#2ed+)" a%%left "#ng t, e UN (9A at t, e date o t, e %a"ment4

:3. T,e T*#) una& #s a 6a*e o #ts Ju*#s%*uden\$e #n t,e \$ase o Castelli UNDT/2010/011 .see %a*a. 130+ 6#t, *es%e\$t to t,e #nte*est *ate to)e %a#d as %a*t o t,e a 6a*d o \$om%ensat#on unde* a*t. 10.:+ name&" t,atF

BaCt akk e2ents+ t,e onk" 6a" #n 6,#\$, t,e a%%\psi \$\text{\$\shape \$\text{\$\text{\$\shape \$\text{\$\shape \$\shape \$\text{\$\shape \$\text{\$\shape \$\text{\$\shape \$\shape \$\text{\$\shape \$\shape \$\text{\$\shape \$\text{\$\shape \$\shape \$\text{\$\shape \$\shape \$\text{\$\shape \$\text{\$\shape \$\text{\$\shape \$\shape \$\shape \$\text{\$\shape \$\shape \$\shape \$\shape \$\

:'. 5u*t,e*mo*e+ t,e T*#)una& *e\$a&&s t,at #n Warren 2010/UNAT/0:9+ t,e

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2016/089

Judgment No. UNDT/2017/013

62.

Ante*ed #n t,e 9eg#ste* on t,#s 7^{t} , da" o - a*\$, 2017 .)igned0 9en0 - . Va*gas - .+ 9eg#st*a*+ Gene2a