Introduction

1. The A !"#ant #ontests the te\$m"nat"on of h"s f"%ed&te\$m a o"ntment ' "th

se6en t\$eatments #!a"med . / the A $\$!"#ant ' e\$e adm"tted and t\$eated at the #ent\$e-' h"!st fou\$ ' e\$e outsou\$#ed. U on \$e#e" t of these ans ' e\$s f\$om the do#to\$- a mem.e\$ of the C\$aud :n6est"gat"on Un"t of V<: stated- "n an ema"! of 2> (a\$#h 2014 to the do#to\$- the fo!!o ' "ngF 16. 4 n 21 August 2014- the A !"#ant Eo"ned UNA (A as an Hng"nee\$)P&8,- on a f"%ed&te\$m a o"ntment.

17. </ lette\$ dated 27 (a\$#h 2010- the H%e#ut"6e Coo\$d"nato\$- UNV- fo\$ ' a\$ded V<:7s "n6est"gat"on \$e o\$t- dated 16 De#em.e\$ 2018- to the De a\$tment of C"e!d 1u o\$t)*DC1+, at 2ead5ua\$te\$s. DC1 ' as ad6"sed that- afte\$ \$e6"e' of the "n6est"gat"on and the A !"#ant7s #omments- APD (found the a!!egat"ons to .e *#on6"n#"ng!/ su.stant"ated+I the #ase ' as- the\$efo\$e- #ons"de\$ed as one of se\$"ous m"s#ondu#t as def"ned "n the Code of Condu#t fo\$ UNVs- and "n 6"o!at"on of the Cond"t"ons of 1e\$6"#e fo\$ UNVs 200>. <ased on APD (7s \$e#ommendat"ons- the H%e#ut"6e Coo\$d"nato\$ #on#!uded that summa\$/ d"sm"ssa! ' ou!d ha6e .een the a \$o \$"ate d"s#" !"na\$/ measu\$e to ha6e ta?en had the A !"#ant st"!! .een se\$6"ng as a UN Vo!untee\$.

1>. 4n the same da/- the H%e#ut"6e Coo\$d"nato\$- UNV- sent a !ette\$ to theA !"#ant #on6e/"ng these #on#!us"ons.

1D. </ memo $\$ andum dated 10 June 2010- the Ass"stant 1e#\$eta\$/&Gene\$a! fo\$ C"e!d 1u o\$t)*A1G/DC1+, \$efe\$\$ed the matte\$ to the A1G/423 (\$e#ommend"ng the te\$m"nat"on of the A !"#ant7s #ont\$a#t on the .as"s of fa#ts ante\$"o\$ to h"s a o"ntment ' "th UNA (A. The \$efe\$\$a! "n#!uded the !ette\$ of 27 (a\$#h 2010 to DC1 and the V<:7s "n6est"gat"on \$e o\$t.

20. </ lette\$ dated 22 1e tem.e\$ 2010- the A1G/4 2 3 (- set out the \$e!"m"na\$/ f"nd"ngs \$ega\$d"ng the a!!egat"ons of med"#a! "nsu\$an#e f\$aud- and "nfo\$med the A !"#ant that #ons"de\$at"on ' as .e"ng g"6en to se a\$at"ng h"m fo\$ fa#ts ante\$"o\$ to h"s a o"ntment. 2 e ' as "n6"ted to \$es ond to th"s !ette\$- ' h"#h he d"d ./ su.m"tt"ng ' \$"tten #omments- dated 4 4#to.e\$ 2010- \$e"te\$at"ng that he d"d not #omm"t f\$aud aga"nst V<: and stat"ng that the #on#!us"ons of V<: and UNV ' e\$e f!a ' ed. A a\$t f\$om asse\$t"ng h"s "nno#en#e and e!a.o\$at"ng on e\$#e"6ed sho\$t#om"ngs of the "n6est"gat"on- he d"d not \$o6"de an/ f\$esh e6"den#e o\$ e% !anat"on. :n a\$t"#u!a\$- he d"d not "dent"f/ the med"#a! esta.!"shments at ' h"#h he #!a"med to ha6e \$e#e"6ed "n& at"ent t\$eatment.

21. </ !ette\$ dated 1 De#em.e\$ 2010- de!"6e\$ed to the A !"#ant t ' o da/s !ate\$the A1G/423 ("nfo\$med the A !"#ant of the de#"s"on to te\$m"nate h"s a o"ntment u\$suant to staff \$egu!at"on D.8)a,)6, and staff \$u!e D.6)#,)6, fo\$ fa#ts ante\$"o\$ to h"s #ont\$a#t ' h"#h- "f the/ had .een ?no ' n at the t"me- ' ou!d ha6e \$e#!uded h"s a o"ntment- a\$t"#u!a\$!/ the su.m"ss"on of med"#a! "nsu\$an#e #!a"ms #onta"n"ng fa!se "nfo\$mat"on. The A !"#ant ' as "nfo\$med that the de#"s"on ' as to ta?e effe#t on 2 Janua\$/ 2016.

22. 4n 20 De#em.e\$ 2010- the A !"#ant \$e5uested management e6a!uat"on of the te\$m"nat"on of h"s a o"ntment.

28. 4n 11 A \$"! 2016- th"s a !"#at"on ' as f"!ed. The 3es ondent \$e !"ed on 18 (a/ 2016. A #ase management d"s#uss"on too? !a#e on 14 Ce.\$ua\$/ 2017.

Parties' submissions

24. The A !"#ant7s \$"n#" a! #ontent"ons a\$eF

a. The #ontested de#"s"on "s .ased on V<:7s "n6est"gat"on \$e o\$t- 'h"#h suffe\$ed f\$om a num.e\$ of def"#"en#"esI "n a\$t"#u!a\$- "t 'as "ssued .efo\$e fu\$the\$ "n6est"gato\$/ ste s had .een #ondu#ted "n \$es onse to the A !"#ant7s #omments that the #!"n"# d"d "n fa#t #a\$\$/ out some med"#a! o#edu

.. 2e su.m"tted #!a"ms- su o\$ted ./ "n6o"#es- and the\$e 'as no e6"den#e "nd"#at"ng that the t\$eatment he \$e#e"6ed 'as "m oss".!e-"m !aus".!e o\$ un\$easona.!/ e% ens"6eI the #!"n"# e%"sted- had a s e#"f"ed add\$ess and the #!"n"#7s #h"ef h/s"#"an 6e\$"f"ed the !"?e!"hood of the t\$eatmentI the #!"n"# 'as #a a.!e of adm"n"ste\$"ng the t\$eatments as 'e!! as

the same standa\$d of \$oof a !"#a.!e to d"s#" !"na\$/ \$o#eed"ngs- that "s-#!ea\$ and #on6"n#"ng e6"den#e. At no o"nt 'as the e6"den#e assessed aga"nst th"s standa\$d. 2 ad th"s .een done- at !east the ema"! of 2> (a\$#h 2014 f\$om V<:7s :n6est"gat"on Un"t 'ou!d h

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2016/024

86. :n su#h #"\$#umstan#es- the Adm"n"st\$at"on "s \$e5u"\$ed to e%am"ne the "nfo\$mat"on \$e#e"6ed "n a fa"\$ and .a!an#ed manne\$- and to \$o6"de the staff mem.e\$ ' "th an ade5uate o o\$tun"t/ to #omment on the "nfo\$mat"on \$e#e"6ed and to addu#e an/ fu\$the\$ e% !anat"on o\$ fa#ts.

87. The T\$".una! notes that the 3es ondent has \$odu#ed the do#uments t\$ansm"tted ./ UNV to DC1. Th"s mate\$"a! "n#!udes "nfo\$mat"on and e%#hanges .oth .efo\$e and afte\$ 18 De#em.e\$ 2018 and- a\$t"#u!a!/- the A !"#ant7s ema"! to V<: #ha!!eng"ng the f"nd"ngs "n "ts \$e o\$t.

8>. </ !ette\$ dated 22 4#to.e\$ 2010- the A1G/423 (set out the fa#ts as \$e o\$ted to DC1- and "nfo\$med the A !"#ant that "t #ou!d !ead to the te\$m"nat"on of h"s a o"ntment fo\$ a#ts ante\$"o\$ to h"s a o"ntment- "nd"#at"ng the !ega! .as"s fo\$ th"s. 1he ga6e the A !"#ant an o o\$tun"t/ to #omment. The A !"#ant \$o6"ded a \$es onse- ./ !ette\$ dated 4 4#to.e\$ 2010. 2o ' e6e\$- "n th"s !ette\$ he made no \$e \$esentat"ons of su.stan#e- no\$ d"d he \$o6"de f\$esh e6"den#e that #ou!d ha6e #aused the Adm"n"st\$at"on to \$e#ons"de\$ "ts \$o osed #ou\$se of a#t"on to te\$m"nate h"s a o"ntment.

8D. The T\$".una! f"nds that the A !"#ant 'as t\$eated "n a##o\$dan#e '"th \$o#edu\$a! fa"\$ness and that h"s due \$o#ess \$"ghts 'e\$e \$es e#ted.

Evidence supporting the factual findings on the Applicant's involvement in fraud

40. The a\$t"es d"sag\$ee as to the \$o e\$ standa\$d of \$oof a !"#a.!e "n #ases \$e!ated to fa#ts ante\$"o\$. The 3es ondent su.m"ts that the test of the *.a!an#e of \$o.a."!"t"es+ "s a !"#a.!e- and the A !"#ant su.m"ts that the a !"#a.!e standa\$d fo\$ te\$m"nat"on ./ \$eason of m"s#ondu#t shou!d a !/- ' h"#h a##o\$d"ng to the A ea!s T\$".una!7s #ase&!a' "s that of #!ea\$ and #on6"n#"ng e6"den#e)Molari

41. Th's 's not a d's#' !'na\$/ #ase- .ut one #on#e\$n"ng te\$m"nat"on fo\$ fa#ts ante\$"o\$. A##o\$d"ng!/- "n the a.sen#e of a #!ea\$ a

4>. The T\$".una! o.se\$6es that esta.!"shed fa#ts \$e!at"ng to mu!t" !e "nstan#es of hea!th "nsu\$an#e f\$aud- tota!!"ng se6e\$a! thousands of Un"ted 1tates Do!!a\$s- a\$e d"\$e#t!/ \$e!e6ant "n assess"ng the su"ta."!"t/ of staff. The fa#ts of th"s #ase a\$e suff"#"ent!/ se\$"ous that the/ 'ou!d "n a!! \$o.a."!"t/ ha6e \$esu!ted "n d"s#" !"na\$/ a#t"on aga"nst- and se a\$at"on of- a staff mem.e\$ "n a#t"6e se\$6"#e ' "th the Un"ted Nat"ons)see ! Iais UNDT/2016/1D>,. As the A ea!s T\$".una! he!d "n