

Case No.:

UNITED NATIONS DISPUTE TRIBUNAL

## Introduction

1. B- a88/.;a%.o\$ f./e" o\$ 16 a\$!a)- 2016: %0e A88/.;a\$: a \$o1 )e%).e" s'aff #e# ,e) of %0e U\$.%e" Na%.o\$s 7.g0 Co# #.ss.o\$e) fo) Ref!gees =>UN7CR?@: ;o\$%es% %0e "e;.s.o\$ of %0e 7.g0 Co# #.ss.o\$e): \$o%.f.e" o\$ 16 No2e# ,e) 201(: \$o% %o 8)o#o%e 0.# fo# %0e P6A %o %0e P6( /e2e/ "!).\$g %0e 201A P)o#o%.o\$s Sess.o\$.

2.

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2017/002

! "g#e\$ No. UNDT/201&/0' (/Co).1

sa#e /e2e/. T0e A88/.;a\$ 1 as /a)e) eass.g\$e" .\$. !/- 1&&& %o P)e%o).a: So!%0  
Af).;a as a Reg.o\$a/ D!)a,/e So/!%.o\$s Off.;e): )e#a.\$.\$g a% %0e P6' /e2e/. I\$  
a\$!a)- 2000: %0e A88/.;a\$ )e;e.2e" a\$ .\$. "ef.\$.%e a88o.\$%#e\$. +)o# !/- 2000 %o

7. B- #e#o)a\$"!# "a%e" 1' No2e# ,e) 201(: ,!% ".s%)., !%e" o\$ 16 No2e# ,e) 201(: %0e 7.g0 Co##.ss.o\$e) a"2.se" of %0e \$a#es of %0ose 8)o#o%e" %o %0e P6( /e2e/. T0e A88/.;a\$% 1 as \$o% 8)o#o%e".

\*. T0e A88/.;a\$% )eD!es%e" so#e ;/a).f.;a%.o\$ ;o\$;e)\$.\$g a \$!# ,e) of #a%e)s: fo//o 1.\$g 10.;0 0e s!, #.%%e" a )e;o!)se a88/.;a%.o\$ o\$ 2' De;e# ,e) 201(. T0e A88/.;a\$% 1 as a"2.se" o\$ 22 !/- 2016 %0a% 0e 1 as \$o% s!;;essf!/ .\$.0.s )e;o!)se a88/.;a%.o\$.

&. O\$ 1& Se8%e# ,e) 2016: %0e A88/.;a\$% )eD!es%e" #a\$age#e\$% e2a/!a%.o\$ of %0e "e;.s.o\$ \$o% %o 8)o#o%e 0.# %o %0e P6( /e2e/: %o 10.;0 0e )e;e.2e" a )es8o\$se o\$ 6 De;e# ,e) 2016. T0.s /e%%e): f./e" as A\$\$eC & %o %0e a88/.;a%.o\$: 1 as .\$.%.a// - eC;/!"e" f)o# %0e ;ase f./e , - O)"e) No. 12 =GVA/2017@ of 17 a\$!a)- 2017: as .% ;o\$a.\$e" a\$ offe) of se%%/e#e\$% %0a% s0a// ,e <e8% ;o\$f."e\$%.a/. 7o 1e2e): !8o\$ )e2.e 1 of %0e 10o/e ;ase f./e a\$" f!)%0e) ;o\$s."e)a%.o\$: %0e T)., !\$a/ 0as "e;. "e" %o .\$/!"e .%. \$%0e f./e: g.2e\$ %0a% .%. s %0e o\$/- )es8o\$se %0a% %0e A88/.;a\$% )e;e.2e" %o 0.s )eD!es% fo) #a\$age#e\$% e2a/!a%.o\$ a\$" %0a% a88/

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2017/002

! "g#e\$ No. UNDT/201&0' (/Co).1

,. 7e 0as ,ee\$ "ee8/- 0!)% , - #.s%)ea#e\$ 0e )e;e.2e" .!"0)90220e1 46-0.96022o/e533 1a-3.

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2017/002

! "g#e\$! No. UNDT/201&/0' (/Co)).1

2. +.\$a\$;.a/ ;o#8e\$sa%.o\$ fo) #a%e).a/ "a#ages %a<.\$g .\$.%o  
;o\$. "e)a%.o\$ 0( ) ] T J U276.703(1)- 13.6701( ) ] \$4

UNDT/2016/0(6: 10e)e %0e T)., !\$a/ se% a\$ a/%e)\$a%.2e a#a#!\$% %o )es;.ss.o\$  
a% C7+6:000 g.2e\$ %0e eC%)e#e ".ff.;!/%.es .\$. as;)a.\$.\$g %0e ;0a\$;es of  
8)o#o%.o\$F

e. T0e Res8o\$"e\$% a;<\$o1/e"ge" %0a% %0e ".s;o\$%.!a%.o\$ of 8e)so\$a/  
8)o#o%.o\$s a\$" %0e.) )e8/a;e#e\$% , - a )a\$<6.\$68os% s-s# #a- affe;% %0e  
D!a\$#! # of ;o#8e\$sa%.o\$ .\$. /e! of )es;.ss.o\$ .\$. %0e 8)ese\$% ;ase: as %0e  
A88/.;a\$% 0as )e%).e" a\$" 1as %0!s !\$a,/e %o ;o#8e)e fo) 0.g0e) /e2e/  
8os%.o\$s !\$"e) %0e \$e1 s-s#e#. T0.s s0o!/" ,e ,a/a\$;e" aga.\$s% %0e fa;% %0a%  
%0e A88/.;a\$% 0a" \$e2e) ,ee\$ se/e;%e" fo) a P6( 8os%.o\$. T0e ;ase of  
UNAT6201060' ': 10e)e %0e A88ea/s T)., !\$a/ se% %0e a#a#!\$% of  
;o#8e\$sa%.o\$ %o %0)ee #o\$%OsB \$e% ,ase sa/a)- .\$. s.#./a) ;.); ! #s#a\$;es: .s a  
)e/e2a\$% 8)e;e"\$e\$. T0.s 1o!/" ,e #o)e %0a\$ %0e ".ffe)e\$;e .\$. sa/a)- fo) %1o  
-ea)s )eD!es"e" , - %0e A88/.;a\$% , !% %0e Res8o\$"e\$%

=a Res;.ss.o\$ of %0e ;o\$iesie" a" #.\$.s%)a%.2e "e;.s.o\$  
o) s8e;.f.; 8e)fo)#a\$;e: 8)o2."e" %0a%: 10e)e %0e ;o\$iesie"  
a" #.\$.s%)a%.2e "e;.s.o\$ ;o\$;e)\$s a88o.\$%#e\$%: 8)o#o%.o\$ o)  
%e)#.\$.s%.o\$: %0e D.s8!%e T).,\$a/ s0a// a/so se% a\$ a#o!\$% of  
;o#8e\$sa%.o\$ %0a% %0e )es8o\$"e\$% #a- e/e;% %o 8a- as a\$ a/%e)\$a%.2e  
%o %0e )es;.ss.o\$ of %0e ;o\$iesie" a" #.\$.s%)a%.2e "e;.s.o\$ o) s8e;.f.;  
8e)fo)#a\$;e o)"e": s!,Ee;% %o s!,8a)ag)a80 =,@ of %0e 8)ese\$%  
8a)ag)a80F

.,@ Co#8e\$sa%.o\$ fo) 0a)#: s!88o)%e" , - e2."e\$;e:  
.o%





a %).a/ ;o!)% %o se% "a#ages fo )/oss of ;0a\$;e of 8)o#o%.o\$ a\$" %0a% ea;0 ;ase # !s%  
%!)\$ o\$ .%s fa;%s? =see 20126UNAT621&: 8)a.a. 22F  
201(6UNAT660' @.

1&. T0e A88/.;a\$ )eD!es%e" .\$. 0.s a88/.;a%.o\$ ;o#8e\$sa%.o\$ eD!.2a/e\$% %o %0e  
".ffe)e\$;e .\$. 0.s sa/a)- a% %0e /as% #o\$%0 8).o) %o 0.s )e%. )e#e\$% a\$" %0a% 10.;0 0e  
1o!/" 0a2e )e;e.2e" 0a" 0e ,ee\$ 8)o#o%e": fo) a 8e).o" of % 1o -eas. A; ;o)" .\$.g  
%o %0e Res8o\$"e\$%: %0.s 1o!/" a#o!\$% %o USD7:77A. T0e A88/.;a\$ a/so s%a%e" .\$.  
0.s %es%.#o\$- %0a% %0e ;o\$%es%e" "e;.s.o\$ .#8a;%e" o\$ 0.s 8e\$\$.o\$ a/0o!g0 0e .s  
\$o% .\$. a 8os%.o\$ %o ;a/;!/a%e %0e a;%!a/ .#8a;% Co!\$se/ fo) %0e Res8o\$"e\$%s.#./a)/-  
a;<\$o 1/e"ge" %0a% assess.\$g %0e .#8a;% of %0e /oss of a\$ o88o)%!\$.%- fo) 8)o#o%.o\$  
o\$ %0e A88/.;a\$%Bs 8e\$\$.o\$ 1o!/" )eD!. )e ;o#8/eC a;%!a).a/ ;a/;!/a%.o\$ s a\$" s%a%e"  
%0a% .% 1as 8)e8a)e" %o 8a- ;o#8e\$sa%.o\$ .\$. %0e a#o!\$% of %0e #o\$%0sB \$e% ,ase  
sa/a)-: ,ase" o\$ %0e A88ea/s T)., !\$a/Bs E!).s8)! "e\$;e .\$. : e2e\$ .f %0.s .s  
#o)e %0a\$ 10a% .s as<e" , - %0e A88/.;a\$%.

20. T0e T)., !\$a/ s%)esses %0a% se%%.\$g %0e a#o!\$% of ;o#8e\$sa%.o\$ .\$. /e! !\$"e)  
se; . 10.(=a@ of .%s S%a%!%e .s ".ffe)e\$% f)o# ;a/;!/a%. \$g #a%e).a/ "a#ages !\$"e)  
se; . 10.(=, @. T0e T)., !\$a/ .s #a\$"a%e" , - .%s S%a%!%e %o se% a\$ a#o!\$% of  
;o#8e\$sa%.o\$ %0a% %0e Res8o\$"e\$% #a- e/e;% %o 8a- .\$. /e! of )es;.\$" .\$.g %0e  
"e;.s.o\$ 10e\$ %0e /a%%e) ;o\$;e)\$s: : a 8)o#o%.o\$. E2e\$ .f %0e A88/.;a\$% ." "  
\$o% as< fo) a\$- ;o#8e\$sa%.o\$ .\$. /e! !\$"e) se; . 10.(=a@: %0e T)., !\$a/ # !s% se% o\$e.  
T0e T)., !\$a/ .s %0e)efo) of %0e 2.e1 %0a% .%.s \$o% ,o!\$" , - %0e )eD!es% #a"e , - %0e  
A88/.;a\$% a\$" #a- a 1a)" #o)e: !\$/.<e ;o#8e\$sa%.o\$ fo) 0a)# !\$"e) se; . 10.(=, @.  
T0e ;o\$;ess.o\$ #a"e , - Co!\$se/ fo) %0e Res8o\$"e\$% .\$. %0.s ;ase %o 8a- #o)e %0a\$  
10a% .s a;%!a/- )eD!es%e" , - %0e A88/.;a\$% !\$"e) %0.s 0ea". \$g of )e#e"- a/so  
1a))a\$%s ;o\$\$. "e)a%.o\$ a\$" f!)%0e) E!s%.f.es %0e T)., !\$a/ \$o% %o /.#.%. %se/f %o %0e  
A88/.;a\$%Bs ;/a.#.

21. T0e T)., !\$a/ a/so )e;a/s %0a% ;o#8e\$sa%.o\$ .\$. /e! see<s %o ;o#8e\$sa%e s%aff  
#e# ,e)s fo) %0e fa;% %0a% %0e O)ga\$.9a%.o\$ 1.// \$o% )es;.\$": o) .\$. %0.s ;ase; ;a\$%o\$  
8)a;%.;a/- )es;.\$" a "e;.s.o\$ %a<e\$ .\$. 2.o/a%.o\$ of %0e.) %e)#s a\$" ;o\$".%o\$% of  
e#8/o-#e\$%: as 1o!/" o%0e)1.se ,e %0e ;ase. I% "oes \$o% see< %o ;o#8e\$sa%e a  
s8e;.f.; 0a)# 10.;0 # !s% ,e s!88o)%e" , - e2."e\$;e. I\$ %0.s )es8e;%: %0e ".ffe)e\$;e

of sa/a)- ,e% 1 ee\$ %0e /e2e/ of %0e A88/.;a\$ a% %0e % .#e of 0.s )e%. )e #e\$% a\$" %0e o\$e  
0e #a- 0a2e o, %a.\$e" 0a" 0e ,ee\$ 8)o#o%e" .s )e/e2a\$% .\$. ;a/; !/a%.\$g %0e D!a\$% ! #  
, !% \$o% "e)e)#.\$a%.2e. I\$"ee": %0e D!a\$% ! # of %0e ;o#8e\$sa%.o\$ .\$. /e! .\$.  
1 as es%a,/.s0e" ,ase" o\$ ;o#8e\$sa%.o\$ a 1 a)"e" .\$. s.#./a) ;ases  
, - %0e A88ea/s T)., !\$a/ a\$" %0e D.s8!%e T)., !\$a/: a\$" \$o% , - a #e)e ;a/; !/a%.o\$ of  
%0e ".ffe)e\$;e of sa/a)-. I% .s f!)%0e) \$o%e" %0a% a// s%aff #e# ,e)s 10o ;0a//e\$ge"  
%0e "e;.s.o\$ \$o% %o 8)o#o%e %0e# "!).\$g %0e 201' P)o#o%.o\$s Sess.o\$: .\$/!"\$. \$g  
%0e A88/.;a\$: 1 e)e a 1 a)"e" C7+6:000 as ;o#8e\$sa%.o\$ .\$. /e! of )es;.ss.o\$ =see

F

1'. T0e T)., !\$a/ %0e)efo)e a//o1s %0e a88ea/ .\$. 8a): se% as."e  
%0e UNDT%o)"e) fo) 8a- #e\$% of &:000 S1.ss f)a\$;s .\$. /e! of  
)es;.ss.o\$ of %0e ;o\$%es" "e;.s.o\$ a\$" o)"e)s %0a% 4 e,%o!;0e ,e  
8a." %0e eD!.2a/e\$% of ' #o\$%Os \$e% ,ase sa/a)- a% %0e %.#e of 0.s  
)e%).e#e\$%.

2A. T0e T)., !\$a/: %a<.\$g a// of %0e ;.);! #s%a\$;es .\$.%o ;o\$%."e)a%.o\$: se% %0e  
8a- #e\$% of ;o#8e\$sa%.o\$ .\$. /e! of )es;.ss.o\$ a% %0)ee #o\$%Os% \$e% ,ase sa/a)- a%



a D61 ;o//eag!e %0a% 0e 1e\$% %o %0e T)., !\$a/ a\$ " ". \$o% ge% 8)o#o%e"? ,!% go%  
#o\$e-. 7e " ". \$o% %a<e %0e ;o#8e\$sa%.o\$ as %0.s .s \$o% 10- 0e s%a)%e" %0.s 8)o;ess:  
10.;0 0a" ")a.\$e" 0.# %o a 8o.\$% 10e)e 0e 1o\$"e)s 10- 0e 1as "o.\$g .%.  
U/%.#a%e/-: .% 1as fo) %0e )e;og\$.%.o\$ of 0.s 1o)<: 10.;0 0e s%./ " ". \$o% ge%. 7e  
;o\$;/!"e" 0.s s! , # .ss.o\$s , - sa-.\$g:

A% %0e e\$" of %0.s 8)o;ess: fo# %0e 8)o#o%.o\$ sess.o\$s: a88ea/  
T)., !\$a/ "e;.s.o\$: a\$" )e#e".a/ a;%%.o\$s: l /ea2e 1.%0 a fee/.\$g %0a%  
%0e O)ga\$.9a%.o\$ fo) 10.;0 l "e".;a%e" 2' -eas of /.fe "oes \$o% see  
#e as 0! #a\$ ,e.\$g. l a# \$o% )e;og\$.9e" as a ;o//eag!e %o 10o#  
.\$E!s%.;e 1as "o\$e: , !% )a%0e) as a >foo% so/"e)? 10o 1as >;o//a%e)a/  
"a#age?.

' (. T0e A88/.;a\$ a/so see<s 8!\$.%.2e "a#ages. A).;/e 10.7 of %0e T)., !\$a/bs S!a%!e eC8)ess/- 8)e2e\$%s s!;0 "a#ages ,e.\$g a 1a)"e": s!a%. \$g %0a% >G%H0e D.s8!%e T)., !\$a/ s0a// \$o% a 1a)" eCe#8/a)- o) 8!\$.%.2e "a#ages.? T0.s ;/a.# #!s% %0e)efo)e ,e )eEe;%e".

Conclusion

'6. I\$ 2.e 1 of %0e fo)ego.\$g: %0e T)., !\$a/ o)"e)s:

a. T0e ;o\$%es%e" "e;.s.o\$ "e\$-. \$g %0e A88/.;a\$ a 8)o#o%.o\$ %o %0e P6( /e2e/ .s 0e)e, - )es;.\$"e"F

.. S0o!/" %0e Res8o\$"e\$% e/e;% %o 8a- f.\$a\$;.a/ ;o#8e\$sa%.o\$ .s%ea" of effe;%2e/- )es;.\$" . \$g %0e "e;.s.o\$: 0e s0a// 8a- %0e A88/.;a\$ a\$ a#o!\$% eD!.2a/e\$% %o %0e)ee #o\$%0s\$ \$e% ,ase sa/a)-: ,e.\$g %0e g)oss sa/a)- /ess s!aff assess#e\$: a% %0e %.#e of %0e A88/.;a\$%Bs )e%).e#e\$%F

;. T0e afo)e#e\$%.o\$e" ;o#8e\$sa%.o\$ .s /e! of )es;ss.o\$ s0a// ,ea) .s%e)es% a% %0e U\$.%e" S!a%es 8).#e )a%e 1.%0 effe;% f)o# %0e "a%e %0.s ! "g#e\$% ,e;o#es eCe; !%a,/e !\$%./ 8a- #e\$% of sa." ;o#8e\$sa%.o\$. A\$ a"" .%o\$a/ f.2e 8e) ;e\$% s0a// ,e a88/.e" %o %0e U\$.%e" S!a%es 8).#e )a%e 60 "a-s f)o# %0e "a%e %0.s ! "g#e\$% ,e;o#es eCe; !%a,/eF

". Pa)ag)a80s '2 a\$" ' ' 0e)eof s0a// ,e )e"a;%e" .s %0e 8! ,./; 2e)s.o\$ of %0.s E! "g#e\$% so as \$o% %o ".s;/ose "e!a./s of %0e

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2017/002

! "g#e\$! No. UNDT/201&/0' (/Co)).1

= @

! "ge Ro 1a\$ Do 1\$. \$g

Da!e" %0.s 2\*!0 "a- of +e, )!a)- 201&

E\$(e)e" . \$ %0e Reg.s!e) o\$ %0.s 2\*!0 "a- of +e, )!a)- 201&

= @

Re\$3 4. Va)gas 4.: Reg.s!a): Ge\$e2a